



Spiritism and Health - A Narrative Appraisal of the Scientific Publication Growth from the Last 30 Years

Marcelo Saad*

Professor at Post-Graduation Course of Spiritual Support, Universidade Paulista, S. Paulo, SP (Brazil)

Email: msaad@uol.com.br

Roberta De Medeiros

Professor of Physiology on Healthcare Graduation Courses, Centro Universitário Lusfada, S. Paulo, SP (Brazil)

Article History

Received: April 10, 2020

Revised: May 4, 2020

Accepted: May 12, 2020

Published: May 14, 2020

Abstract

Spiritism brought many insights about life, health, disease, cure, and death. In Brazil, they are adopted on thousands of Spiritist centers, on many Spiritist-oriented psychiatric hospitals, and on Spiritist support for inpatients. The objective of this paper is to make a narrative appraisal of scientific publications in the last 30 years linking Spiritism and health. A literature search revealed 71 pertinent papers. Over the decades, the increase in the number of published papers is noticeable. These data could deploy more interest on Spiritism and health correlation, warranting its place in high-level academic discussion, with funding institutions considering address grants for this field.

Keywords: Spiritism; spiritual therapies; Spiritual healing; Religion and medicine.

1. Introduction

Spiritism was organized in France by the teacher and educator Hippolyte L. D. Rivail (1804-1869), also known by his pseudonym Allan Kardec. By the mid-1800s, he made a rational investigation of communication with spirits through mediums. He compiled the answers provided by the spirits for questions regarding the origin of the spirits, the purpose of this life, the order of the universe, evil and good, and the afterlife. The Spiritist codification is a set of observations and principles, bringing concepts for many questions related to virtually every human sphere¹. Spiritism brought new and more profound concepts concerning what we (human beings) are, where we have come from, where we are going, what is the objective of our existence, and what is the reason for pain and suffering. Thus, many Spiritist tenets are related to processes such as life, health, disease, cures, and death. The main ones are listed as follows [1]:

- The spirit is the transpersonal, ethereal and immaterial essence of the human being
- The nature of the spirit is related to an immaterial reality that is beyond our current capacity of consistent access
- When the spirit is incarnated in a physical body, it is called soul, because some of its characteristics are blocked by matter
- Physical and mental diseases are at least partially determined by an unbalanced state of the soul dynamics
- The soul is responsible for all mind properties, which are manifested through the brain activity
- In some states of consciousness, the mind can capture information beyond the physical senses
- Spirits may influence physiological and psychological states of individuals, either beneficially or harmfully
- Ostensible communication of spirits with men occurs through mediums, usually through writing or speech
- After brain death, the soul keeps its individuality and the personality from the previous experience
- Spirits must pass through many incarnations; they bring to the new existence everything acquired in past lives

For the last 150 years, Spiritism has spread to many countries, and Brazil is the country in which the most significant number of followers can be found. While Spiritism emerged essentially as a lay movement, it took contours of a belief system in Latin America. The Spiritist center is the basic unit of organization of Spiritism, and most attendees seek them out due to physical and mental health problems [2]. The thousands of Spiritist centers in Brazil are highly sought after due to their healing practices. Specific therapeutic approaches were developed by followers to prevent and to restore a balanced “spiritual-energetic” state, counting on the help of benefactor spirits [3].

Over time, Spiritist proposals to promote health have come to compose an important movement in Brazil, with practices intended to be complementary to conventional treatment. Besides the Spiritist centers, these activities are developed in other environments, such as inpatients at Spiritist-oriented institutions [4], and spiritual support for inpatients at general hospitals [5]. With such development, Spiritism brought suggestions for many topics that may apply to healthcare. Always relying on the help of spiritual benefactors, the main Spiritist practices for health [6] include:

¹ More details about Spiritism is available in English on many websites, such as <https://bussuk.webs.com/about-Spiritism> or <https://www.Spiritist.us/Spiritism>

*Corresponding Author

- *passe* (laying on of hands for vital fluid transfer);
- fluid therapy (using a physical intermediary such as energized water);
- prayer (to attract good influences to him/herself or to others);
- intimate reform (cultivation of virtues, the practice of altruism);
- *disobsession* therapy (releasing from the negative influence of spirits).

In addition to these practices present in almost all Spiritist centers, other more specific forms of treatment, available in few places, include:

- spiritual surgery (procedure under a trance, sometimes with real cutting);
- *apometry* (elevation of the astral body to the spiritual realm for intervention);
- past lives therapy (remembrance of traumas on previous incarnations).

This rich association between Spiritism and health has been progressively studied empirically and recorded in scientific publications. To date, no comprehensive analysis has been made on this literary production, especially on its continuous growth. Thus, the objective of this paper is to make a narrative appraisal of scientific publications in the last 30 years linking Spiritism and health. The focus of this paper is a bibliometric assessment concerning the volume of publications per decade, the countries associated with the highest production, and the type of publication. The motivation for this work was to provoke a test on the increasing academic interest in this matter .

2. Methodology

A search for papers indexed on *Pubmed* and *Scholar Google* databases was made in late January 2020 with the following strategy:

- words in the title and/or abstract: Spiritism or Spiritist, also in Spanish, French or Portuguese versions (*espírita, espiritismo, espiritista, spirite, spiritisme*);
- year of publication: the period between 1990 and 2019;
- language of publication: English, Spanish, French or Portuguese;
- sources: only peer-reviewed journals dedicated to scientific publication.
- subject: texts that address specifically the correlation between Spiritism and health

This search excluded materials according to these criteria:

- contents of books or their chapters, as well as master or doctoral theses;
- papers that had focuses other than health, such as sociology, theology, etc.;
- texts without clear boundaries with other traditions, such as Umbanda, Santería, etc².

3. Results

Seventy-one papers that met the above requirements were selected. The papers were compiled in Chart 1, ordered by ascending chronological year of publication, with a brief phrase of what each text is about. Because it is very extensive, Chart 1 is located as an Appendix, at the end of this manuscript. To analyze the evolution of the volume of publications over time, the papers were grouped into 10-year periods. This division revealed the following distribution:

- between 1990 and 1999 = 10 papers;
- between 2000 and 2009 = 17 papers;
- between 2010 and 2019 = 44 papers.

3.1. Publications by Country of the main Author

Regarding the country associated with the institution of the main author, it was verified that:

- Brazil = 42 papers;
- The United States = 15 papers;
- France = 3 papers;
- Spain = 2 papers.

Nine other countries were associated with only one paper each: Argentina, Colombia, Hungary, Netherlands, New Zealand, Philippines, Portugal, Puerto Rico, and the United Kingdom. An analysis of the evolution of publications was based on the main author's country.

Table 1 shows the number of papers from Brazil, the United States and other countries in each decade.

Table-1. Number of papers from Brazil, the United States (US) and other countries in each decade

Period	Brazil	US	Others	Total
1990-1999	1	6	3	10
2000-2009	8	6	3	17
2010-2019	33	3	8	44
Total	42	15	14	71

As for the main author, the selection of publications in this work relies on the predominance of the following names: 5 papers from É. M. Carneiro (BR); 5 papers from S. M. Greenfield (US); 5 papers from A. Moreira-Almeida

² Although these other African-rooted belief systems use mediumship and spiritual healing techniques, the purpose of this work is to focus on the Spiritism termed "kardecist".

(BR); 4 papers from G. Lucchetti (BR); and 4 papers from M. Saad (BR). Other names add up to 3 or fewer papers as the main author, but any name can figure as co-author on more publications.

3.2. Publications by Type of Work

Another analysis was by type of work. Papers were classified into three categories, according to the nature of publication:

- Original research (clinical trials, literature review, correlations) = 26 papers;
- reported experience (institute visit; case description, etc.) = 26 papers;
- Historical data (how the relationship Spiritism-health was seen) = 19 papers.

The "research" type papers address, among other topics: reviews of the scientific or classic literature, review of medical records or documents; analysis of the Spiritist therapies use in a geographic region; cross-sectional studies associating Spiritist elements and health parameters; randomized controlled trials on Spiritist interventions. The "experience" papers address, among other topics: descriptions of routines in Spiritist treatment centers; clinical cases in which belief impacted treatment; observations on spiritual surgery or dispossession procedures; reports on Spiritist hospital chaplaincy; similarities of Spiritist proposals and some branches of psychology. The "historical" papers address, among other topics: the ancient view when Spiritist practices were associated with mental imbalance; the symbiotic relationship of the development of Spiritism and Homeopathy; the development of Spiritist institutes of treatment.

The evolution of publications was also analyzed regarding the type of paper. Table 2 shows, for each decade, the incidence of research, experience, and history papers.

Table-2. The incidence of research, experience and historical papers in each decade

Period	Research	Experience	Historical	Total
1990-1999	1	6	3	10
2000-2009	5	8	4	15
2010-2019	20	12	12	43
Total	26	26	19	71

4. Discussion

4.1. Explaining Methodological Choices for this Work

For the analysis made in this work, a search for scientific papers was made in two databases. The first was *Pubmed*, which indexes high-quality international journals. In this phase, we searched for papers that went through a rigorous methodological sieve. Next, the *Scholar Google* search aimed to find papers that also had some merit, published in honest journals, so that the material collected was comprehensive and not elitist. This indulgence was necessary because many *Pubmed* indexed journals tend to reject manuscripts on the wanted theme because of editorial biases. This form of data retrieving has broader literature coverage than a systematic review. However, the search does not have the presumption to exhaust the sources of information, as it does not apply sophisticated strategies. Therefore, the selection of studies may have been subject to the authors' subjectivity, thus lacking synthesis and rigor. The period 1990-2019 was chosen because the format of scientific writing has been better standardized over the past 30 years. For example, the contemporary concept of evidence-based medicine was consolidated in the 1990s.

The words Spiritism and Spiritist (also in their Portuguese, French and Spanish versions) were searched in the title or in the abstract of the paper. These terms were not searched as keywords, as they do not exist as *Medical Subject Headings* on *Pubmed*. Next, a careful verification was made about which papers addressed directly the correlation between Spiritism and health. The exclusion of books or their chapters were made because this material is not reviewed by third parties before publication. Post-graduation theses were also excluded because they are generally also published as papers, and there could be the risk of duplicity.

4.2. Explaining the Various Analyses on Collected Material

In the analysis of the evolution of publications volume, considering the division of 10-year periods, the constant growth of scientific production on this subject is clear, with a significant jump in the last 10 years. In analyzing the countries of the main author's institution, it is important to highlight that some authors have collected data in a different country from that of their institutions. For example, a paper may be associated with the United States (author's country), but the study may have been done by visiting Brazilian institutes. Table 1 showed, in the first decade selected, the large number of North American papers (although many are experience reports in a Brazilian institution). In the second decade, there was an increase in Brazilian production, with a slight decline in US production. In the third decade, the volume of Brazilian publications constituted the absolute majority. The language of the paper was not taken into consideration for an analysis of the publications. Most good quality journals choose English as their language of publication. This means that many Latin American or European authors do not use their native language to write.

Table 2 showed that, in the first selected decade, the papers on reported experiences were the majority. At that time, possibly the authors simply described their testimonies without taking sides or venting explanations for phenomena. In the second decade, there was some growth of the original research papers, but still, those of experience prevailed. And in the third decade, this proportion was inverted, with a predominance of original research

papers. Perhaps this evolution reflects maturation in the study of this field, as well as a fearlessness of researchers to expose themselves without concern for their image.

The present work may have some flaws, due to limitations of the process. First, there is a possibility of some papers being accidentally excluded by the search criteria. Second, the inverse bias: the possible inclusion of papers addressing a form of broader “syncretic” Spiritism. And third, the arbitrariness of the creation of types (research, experience, historical) to group the papers. But even with the recognition of these potential involuntary flaws, the logical thinking is that the findings would not be dramatically modified by them. Thus, one can imagine that the conclusions are within a satisfactory safety margin.

5. Conclusion

Since its origin by the mid-1800s, Spiritism brought many insights about life, health, disease, cure, and death. Based on such principles, some therapeutic approaches have been developed to prevent imbalances and restore health. The thousands of Spiritist centers in Brazil are in great demand by people with physical and mental problems. There are also in Brazil many Spiritist-oriented psychiatric hospitals and, for inpatients at general hospitals, the Spiritist chaplaincy movement is gaining strength. The rich association between Spiritism and health has been progressively studied empirically and recorded in scientific publications. The objective of this paper is to make a narrative appraisal of scientific publications in the last 30 years linking Spiritism and health. The motivation was to provoke a test on the increasing academic interest in this matter. This could inspire the continuation of scientific publications of papers on this subject. A literature search has revealed the existence of 71 pertinent papers. Over the decades, the increase in the number of published papers is noticeable. In the beginning, most materials were from North American authors; progressively, Brazilian authors increased their production, composing today the majority. The number of papers dealing with original research equals that of experience report papers, and next are the papers with historical data. The deployment from this work is the reinforcement that the Spiritism-health correlation has a solid base, warranting its place in the academic discussion at all levels. Besides, on the basis of tracing the output of academic journal citations, funding research institutions could rightly consider address grants for this field.

Appendix A

Chart 1: the evaluated papers, listed in ascending chronological order of publication year, with main author's surname, type of work, country of main author, and a brief paragraph of what the text is about.

(RES = original research; EXP = experience report; HIS = historical data)

(AR = Argentina; BR = Brazil; CO = Colombia; ES = Spain; FR = France; HU = Hungary; NL = Netherlands; NZ = New Zealand; PH = Philippines; PR = Puerto Rico; PT = Portugal; UK = the United Kingdom; US = the United States)

Paper	Type	From	Thematic
Hohmann, <i>et al.</i> [7]	RES	US	It examines the prevalence of spirit healers' use by people in Puerto Rico, the role of Spiritism in providing mental health services, and the association between Spiritism and psychiatric disorders.
Greenfield [8]	EXP	US	It documents the surgical procedures performed by the Brazilian Spiritist healers in trance, during which the healer and the patient enter an altered state of consciousness.
Ronquillo [9]	EXP	US	It presents the case of a Hispanic woman with multiple personality disorder and focuses on the relationship between the Spiritist belief system and this syndrome, highlighting cultural sensitivity.
Greenfield [10]	EXP	US	It describes healing sessions by a group of Spiritist practitioners in Brazil who employ the technique of apometry (transport of the patient to the astral world, to be treated by spiritual physicians).
Parot [11]	HIS	FR	It describes how French scientists in early XX century studied the ectoplasmic materialization; it mentions that failure in such experiments may be associated with biases of researchers.
Greenfield [12]	EXP	US	Discusses unusual spiritual surgeries performed without antisepsis or anesthesia, in which patients bleed minimally, experience little or no pain, and develop no infections or other complications.
Parot [13]	HIS	FR	It reports how psychologists, in the late nineteenth century, collaborated with Spiritists; however, it argues these psychologists may have been too indulgent in some experiments.
Molina [14]	EXP	PR	It finds similarities between Jung's approach and healing by Puerto Rico's Spiritism: transpersonal dimension as a healing element, the expulsion of harmful elements, and the experience of a larger reality.
Paulino [15]	EXP	US	It discusses spiritualism as a healing system used among Caribbean immigrants in North America, focusing on social workers' unpreparedness when these beliefs may influence their attitudes.
Giumbelli [16]	HIS	BR	It describes how Spiritist practices were officially considered as a

			factor of mental illness in the medical and psychiatric common sense in the early decades of the XX century.
Moreira-Almeida, <i>et al.</i> [17]	EXP	BR	He followed 30 procedures performed by a Brazilian Spiritist surgeon, noting that the cuts were real, without anesthesia or antiseptics, practically painless, with no infection 72 hours later.
Tsemberis and Stefancic [18]	EXP	US	It presents the case of a homeless who was believed to be possessed, and he only began participating in psychiatric treatment after a visit by a Puerto Rican Spiritist healer.
Greenfield [19]	EXP	US	It examines the ritual of disobeying by Brazilian spiritualists, raising the hypothesis of the participants in a trance state in which they internalize beliefs that can activate the immune system and other systems.
Krippner and Taubold [20]	EXP	PH	It describes "Christian Spiritism", a Filipino healing system that claims to heal with the power that mediums channel from the "Holy Spirit" in the form of ethereal energy.
Lynch [21]	EXP	US	It examines the preparation of the patient and results perceived by the treatment given by a Brazilian Spiritist healer, highlighting as a key factor for success the use of symbolism in preparations and procedures.
Bragdon [22]	EXP	US	It describes the origin and functioning of Spiritist healing centers in Brazil. Given the reported success over mental, emotional, and physical illness, the author suggests further research.
Moreira-Almeida and Neto [23]	RES	BR	It reviews texts on mental disorders and Spiritism, written in important Spiritist works, which defend a model of spiritual etiology without rejecting the biological, psychological and social causes.
Moreira-Almeida, <i>et al.</i> [24]	RES	BR	It reviews opinions of eminent early XX century psychiatrists about the so-called 'Spiritist madness' and discusses the factors that contributed to the conflict between medicine and Spiritism.
Rivera [25]	HIS	US	It describes how the Puerto Rican people think Spiritism is effective in healing, with effects similar to those achieved in counseling and psychotherapy, meeting people's cultural needs.
Montiel [26]	HIS	ES	An analysis of the XX century encounter in Europe: a clinical theory (animal magnetism), a peculiar belief system (Spiritism), and hysteria as a disease, focusing on their complementarities and inadequacies.
Justo and Gomes [27]	HIS	BR	It describes how homeopathy developed in Santos (Brazil) not only by physicians and pharmacists, but also by prescribing mediums who worked in Spiritist centers, achieving expressive results.
Dalgalarrondo, <i>et al.</i> [28]	RES	BR	It verifies the association between prevalence of mental symptoms and alcohol abuse with service attendance and personal religiosity among Spiritists, Pentecostals, Catholics, and "non-religious" people.
Moreira-Almeida, <i>et al.</i> [29]	RES	BR	When comparing the mental health of spirit mediums and patients with dissociative identity disorder, the mediums presented better scores in various items related to mental health and social adaptation.
Ramírez [30]	EXP	CO	It describes the conception of diseases etiology of Spiritism that, despite working in the body, knows the disease is not necessarily rooted in the matter, addressing other subtle dimensions.
Greenfield [31]	EXP	US	It examines the Brazilian Spiritist therapeutic practices, ranging from trance surgeries to "teleporting" patients' astral bodies to the spiritual realm, where they are treated for illnesses acquired in previous lives.
Isaia [32]	HIS	BR	It analyzes three doctoral theses, defended between 1919 and 1929, at the Faculty of Medicine of Rio de Janeiro; in two, Spiritism is a factor of mental alienation; the other recognizes the Spiritist therapy.
Moreira-Almeida and Koss-Chioino [33]	RES	BR	It explores how Spiritist practices provide some positive results on healing severe mental illness in Puerto Rico and Brazil through interviews with healers, patients, and family members.
Alvarado [34]	HIS	US	It discusses dissociation ideas through hysterical blindness, hypnosis, spontaneous sleepwalking, mediumship, and multiple personalities, illustrating biased concepts from previous scholars.

Santo [35]	EXP	PT	It explores notions of illness and health among spirit mediums in Cuba, where the development of mediumship is not only therapeutic but prophylactic, as a stabilized mediumship can resolve trauma.
Silva and Elias [36]	RES	BR	It researches the positioning of Spiritist representatives on the use of stem cells: the absence of unanimity found will stimulate reflection on the pros and cons of each position, towards a future consensus.
Jabert [37]	RES	BR	It identifies insights and strategies for the treatment and social control of madness developed in the first half of the XX century through analysis of medical records of an institution run by a Spiritist association.
Jabert and Facchinetti [38]	EXP	BR	It presents the conceptions about health, disease, and madness derived from Spiritism and how in which they were engaged in an asylum Spiritist institution in Brazil in the first half of the XX century.
Lucchetti, <i>et al.</i> [6]	RES	BR	It presents a literature review on health outcomes for 6 Spiritist practices: prayer, laying on of hands, magnetized (fluidic) water, charity/volunteering, spiritual education for the virtuous life, and spiritual release therapy.
Míkola [39]	HIS	BR	It discusses how homeopathy in Brazil faced obstacles and how it sought allies in Spiritism after 1860, thanks to the concept of life force suggested by Hahnemann and that of vital fluid suggested by Spiritism.
Lucchetti, <i>et al.</i> [4]	RES	BR	It describes six major Brazilian Spiritist psychiatric hospitals, where conventional treatment is integrated with spiritual therapy, reporting this integration of spiritual practices with standard treatment.
Pereira Neto and Amaro [40]	HIS	BR	It analyzes the rational and scientific Spiritist treatment for mental illness in a Brazilian Spiritist institute, showing similarities and differences between Spiritist and clinical treatments.
Wolffram [41]	HIS	NZ	It discusses the animism versus spiritualism conflict during the late XIX century in the evolution of the emerging sciences in Germany, when contemporary psychology was under construction.
Bragdon and Azevedo [42]	EXP	US	It describes the origin and work of Spiritist psychiatric hospitals in Brazil, which report many successes and offer a model of comprehensive mental health care, combining conventional and Spiritist practices.
Le Maléfan, <i>et al.</i> [43]	HIS	FR	It describes how clinicians, at the turn of the XX century, gave mediumistic delusions a place in nosology, especially in France; through ideological visions, they associated pathology and belief.
Lucchetti, <i>et al.</i> [44]	RES	BR	It discusses how mediumistic texts in the first half of the XX century described important functions of the pineal gland, against medical knowledge of the time, and 13 years before the discovery of melatonin.
Lucchetti, <i>et al.</i> [45]	RES	BR	It compares the effects on bacterial growth in cultures submitted to Spiritist passe, other healing techniques, and in a sample without intervention, in a randomized and blind model.
Weber [46]	HIS	BR	It explores the importance of homeopathy in the first half of the XIX century and how it was approximated to Spiritism through understandings of the spiritual body and vital energy.
Weber [47]	RES	BR	It analyzes the relations through European Spiritist lay publications between 1858 and 1869, showing commonalities about the process of illness and healing between medicine, homeopathy, and spiritualism.
Brancaccio [48]	HIS	NL	Enrico Morselli's interest in physical mediumship, against developments in psychiatry and psychology, when psychiatrists and physiologists were reinterpreting the "supernatural" phenomena.
Graus [49]	HIS	ES	It describes how, in the late XIX century, some Spanish Spiritists tried to legitimize hypnotherapy in medicine by sponsoring a charity clinic where hypnosis treatment was offered.
Lucchetti, <i>et al.</i> [50]	RES	BR	It describes the spiritual care for depression provided by one of the largest Spiritist centers in Brazil. The authors reported spiritual intervention sessions and interviewed some assisted people.
Saad, <i>et al.</i> [51]	EXP	BR	It describes the future development of a "spirit chaplaincy", exploring its concept, design, precepts, and challenges, based on the first results of a Spiritist care program for inpatients.
Anefalos, <i>et al.</i>	EXP	BR	It presents a retrospective analysis of the records made by Spiritist

[52]			chaplains, in a Brazilian hospital, by reviewing 7419 records from care to 2191 inpatients in the previous year.
Bastos Jr., <i>et al.</i> [53]	RES	BR	It studies the neurophysiology of mediums and control subjects, suggesting that increased focused attention with concomitantly decreased self-awareness may play a role in mediumship.
Carneiro, <i>et al.</i> [54]	RES	BR	It evaluates the effects of the Spiritist passe on psychological and physiological parameters on inpatients randomly allocated to the intervention group or control group (false Spiritist passe).
Cavalcante, <i>et al.</i> [55]	RES	BR	It evaluates the effectiveness of the Spiritist passe in volunteers to reduce anxiety symptoms, randomly allocated to the intervention group or the control group (false Spiritist passe).
Gyimesi [56]	HIS	HU	It discusses the connections between Spiritism and the Budapest School of Psychoanalysis, and the support of Hungarian cultural and scientific Spiritism to the evolution of psychoanalysis.
Lucchetti, <i>et al.</i> [2]	RES	BR	It describes the use of complementary practices in Spiritist centers of the largest city in Brazil: how health problems are treated, and their ability to differentiate spiritual experiences from psychiatric disorders.
Vancini, <i>et al.</i> [57]	RES	BR	A review of the vision of epilepsy by Spiritism, the potential of spirituality and religiosity as positive coping strategies, and the need to demystify beliefs to increase the potential of this spiritual dimension.
Alminhana, <i>et al.</i> [58]	RES	BR	Participants with psychotic experiences were recruited from Spiritist centers in Brazil to test whether personality dimensions, as well as schizotypy, are important predictors of quality of life.
Carneiro, <i>et al.</i> [59]	RES	BR	It evaluates the effects on psychological and physiological parameters from: the in cardiovascular patients randomly allocated to the intervention group (true Spiritist passe) or the control group (false).
Moraes [60]	HIS	BR	It analyzes the historical course of the Spiritist discourse on health and its related practices. In each epoch, Spiritism conformed to the therapeutic culture of Europe and Brazil, seeking its legitimacy.
Saad and de Medeiros [61]	EXP	BR	It presents the Spiritist Medical Model, derived from the Spiritist Medical Association founded 5 decades ago, showing various arguments of Spiritism that can contribute to advance the understanding of health.
Saad, <i>et al.</i> [62]	EXP	BR	It shows how the Spiritist Medical Model aims at a change towards a renewed view of human nature, which can contribute to the understanding of many phenomena of consciousness.
Saad, <i>et al.</i> [3]	EXP	BR	It explores the concept of "Spiritist complementary therapies", a range of heterogeneous practices, each with a different potential for integration into conventional medicine.
Anefalos, <i>et al.</i> [5]	EXP	BR	It describes the five years' experience of Spiritist chaplaincy, through records of 41,914 visits to 13,983 inpatients, highlighting the importance of this service and the need for its expansion.
Bastos Jr., <i>et al.</i> [63]	RES	BR	It investigates physiological parameters that could differentiate pathological dissociation from non-pathological mediumship by comparing expert mediums and control subjects during trance experiences.
Carneiro, <i>et al.</i> [64]	RES	BR	It studies the effects of Spiritist passe on the health of hospitalized premature newborns, considering parameters of stress, pain, recovery, and length of stay in the unit, in a randomized controlled trial.
Carneiro, <i>et al.</i> [65]	RES	BR	It compares some forms of complementary Spiritist therapies versus isolated conventional treatment on the emotional state, muscle tension, and well-being of hospitalized patients with HIV / AIDS.
Facchinetti and Jabert [66]	EXP	BR	It analyzes data from a Spiritist sanatorium in Brazil, between 1934 and 1948, focusing on the integration of Spiritist healing practices and conventional psychiatric treatment, as well as acceptance difficulties.
Lambe [67]	HIS	US	It describes Cuba's first and only Spiritist mental clinic, founded in the 1940s and closed in the 1960s, highlighting the persistent preference shown by Cubans for religious forms of mental healing.
Pierini [68]	EXP	UK	It discusses the vision of a Spiritist institution about the etiology of diseases and how mediums understand healing by discerning

			spiritual and pathological experiences.
Sedran, <i>et al.</i> [69]	HIS	AR	It analyzes the persecution by the Argentine Council of Hygiene to the healer Juan Quinteros, in the late XIX century, and identifies the characteristics of Spiritism he used to defend his practice.
Zacaron, <i>et al.</i> [70]	RES	BR	It investigates the effects of Spiritist passé on gait, pain, joint stiffness and functional capacity of older women with knee osteoarthritis in a randomized, prospective, triple-blind controlled trial.
Carneiro, <i>et al.</i> [71]	RES	BR	It studies the effect on preoperative anxiety of inpatients: real Spiritist passe, a false procedure (no intention to cure), and no procedure at all, in a randomized controlled trial.
Weber [72]	EXP	BR	It analyzes how homeopaths and Spiritist practices interacted during the first half of the XX century, in an attempt to understand how these perspectives approached and allowed continuity.

References

- [1] Saad, M. and de Medeiros, R., 2019. "Spiritism and medicine - experiences from the Brazilian Spiritist Medical Model for a paradigm shift in healthcare." In *Saad, M., and de Medeiros, R. (eds). An Examination of Religiosity: Influences, Perspectives and Health Implications. Nova Science Publishers (NY, USA).*
- [2] Lucchetti, Lucchetti, G., and Leão, F. C., 2016. "Mental and physical health and spiritual healing: An evaluation of complementary religious therapies provided by spiritist centers in the city of São Paulo, Brazil." *Cult Med Psychiatry*, vol. 40, pp. 404–421. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11013-015-9478-z>
- [3] Saad, M., Mosini, A. C. F., and de Medeiros, R., 2017c. "Spiritist complementary therapies - ways for future integration to medicine." *Curr Res Complement Altern Med*, vol. 2017, p. 110. Available: <https://doi.org/10.29011/CRCAM-110/100010>
- [4] Lucchetti, Aguiar, P. R. D. C., and Braghetta, C. C., 2012. "Spiritist psychiatric hospitals in Brazil: Integration of conventional psychiatric treatment and spiritual complementary therapy." *Cult Med Psychiatry*, vol. 36, pp. 124–135. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11013-011-9239-6>
- [5] Anfalos, A., Silva, W. A. B., and Pinto, R. M., 2018. "Spiritist hospital chaplaincy in Brazil: 5 years of documented experience." *J. Relig Health*, vol. 57, pp. 1038–1051. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-017-0527-5>
- [6] Lucchetti, Lucchetti, A. L. G., Bassi, R., and Nobre, M., 2011. "Complementary spiritist therapy: Systematic review of scientific evidence." *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, pp. 1-18. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1155/2011/835945>
- [7] Hohmann, A., Richeport, M., Marriott, B., Canino, G., Rubio-Stipek, M., and Bird, H., 1990. "Spiritism in puerto rico: Results of an Island-wide community study." *British Journal of Psychiatry*, vol. 156, pp. 328-335. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1192/bjp.156.3.328>
- [8] Greenfield, S., 1991. "Hypnosis and trance induction in the surgeries of Brazilian spiritist healer-mediums1." *Anthropology of Consciousness*, vol. 2, pp. 20-25. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1525/ac.1991.2.3-4.20>
- [9] Ronquillo, E. B., 1991. "The influence of "Espiritismo" on a case of multiple personality disorder." *Dissociation: Progress in the Dissociative Disorders*, vol. 4, pp. 39–45. Available: <https://scholarsbank.uoregon.edu/xmlui/handle/1794/1747>
- [10] Greenfield, S., 1992. "Spirits and Spiritist therapy in Southern Brazil: A case study of an innovative, syncretic healing group." *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, vol. 16, pp. 23-51. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00054438>
- [11] Parot, F., 1993. "Psychology experiments: Spiritism at the sorbonne." *Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences*, vol. 29, pp. 22-28. Available: [https://doi.org/10.1002/1520-6696\(199301\)29:1<22::AID-JHBS2300290104>3.0.CO;2-T](https://doi.org/10.1002/1520-6696(199301)29:1<22::AID-JHBS2300290104>3.0.CO;2-T)
- [12] Greenfield, S., 1994. "A model explaining Brazilian Spiritist surgeries and other unusual, religious-based healings." *Subtle Energies*, vol. 5, pp. 109-141. Available: <http://journals.sfu.ca/seemj/index.php/seemj/article/viewFile/181/146>
- [13] Parot, F., 1994. "Le bannissement des esprits Naissance d'une frontière institutionnelle entre Spiritisme et psychologie." *Revue de Synthèse*, vol. 115, pp. 417-443. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/bf03181252>
- [14] Molina, M., 1996. "Archetypes and spirits: A jungian analysis of puerto rican espiritismo." *Journal of Analytical Psychology*, vol. 41, pp. 227-244. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1465-5922.1996.00227.x>
- [15] Paulino, A., 1996. "Spiritism, Snaterí, Brujería, and voodooism." *Journal of Teaching in Social Work*, vol. 12, pp. 105–124. Available: https://doi.org/10.1300/J067v12n01_08
- [16] Giumbelli, E., 1997. "Heresia, doença, crime ou religião: o ESpiritismo no discurso de médicos e cientistas sociais." *Revista de Antropologia*, vol. 40, pp. 31-82. Available: <https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0034-77011997000200002>
- [17] Moreira-Almeida, A., Almeida, T. M. d., and Gollner, A. M., 2000. "Cirurgia espiritual: uma investigação." *Revista da Associação Médica Brasileira*, vol. 46, pp. 194-200. Available: <https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0104-42302000000300002>

- [18] Tsemberis, S. and Stefancic, A., 2000. "The role of an espiritista in the treatment of a homeless, mentally ill hispanic man." *Psychiatric Services*, vol. 51, pp. 1572–1574. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ps.51.12.1572>
- [19] Greenfield, S., 2004. "Treating the sick with a morality play: The kardecist-spiritist disobsession in Brazil." *Social Analysis*, vol. 48, Available: <https://doi.org/10.3167/015597704782352537>
- [20] Krippner, S. and Taubold, S., 2004. "Constructing a model of espiritista healing in the philippines." *Anthropology of Consciousness*, vol. 15, pp. 42–51. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1525/ac.2004.15.1.42>
- [21] Lynch, D., 2004. "Patient preparation and perceived outcomes of spiritist healing in Brazil." *Anthropology of Consciousness*, vol. 15, pp. 10-41. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1525/ac.2004.15.1.10>
- [22] Bragdon, E., 2005. "Spiritist healing centers in Brazil." *Seminars in Integrative Medicine*, vol. 3, pp. 67-74. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sigm.2005.02.001>
- [23] Moreira-Almeida, A. and Neto, F., 2005a. "Spiritist views of mental disorders in Brazil." *Transcultural Psychiatry*, vol. 42, pp. 570-595. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461505058916>
- [24] Moreira-Almeida, A., de Almeida, A., and Neto, F., 2005b. "History of 'Spiritist madness' in Brazil." *History of Psychiatry*, vol. 16, pp. 5-25. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957154X05044602>
- [25] Rivera, E. T., 2005. "Espiritismo: The flywheel of the puerto rican spiritual traditions." *Interamerican Journal of Psychology*, vol. 39, pp. 295-300. Available: <https://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=284/28439214>
- [26] Montiel, L., 2006. "Síntomas de una época: Magnetismo, histeria y Epiritismo en la Alemania romántica." *Asclepio*, vol. 58, pp. 11-38. Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.3989/asclepio.2006.v58.i2.20>
- [27] Justo, C. and Gomes, M., 2007. *A cidade de Santos no roteiro de expansão da homeopatia nos serviços públicos de saúde no Brasil* vol. 14. História, Ciências: Saúde-Manguinhos. pp. 1159-1171.
- [28] Dalgalarondo, P., Marín-León, L., Botega, N., De Azevedo Barros, M., and Bosco de Oliveira, H., 2008. "Religious affiliation and psychiatric morbidity in brazil: Higher rates among evangelicals and spiritists." *International Journal of Social Psychiatry*, vol. 54, pp. 562-574. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020764008091439>
- [29] Moreira-Almeida, A., Neto, F., and Cardeña, E., 2008. "Comparison of brazilian spiritist mediumship and dissociative identity disorder." *The Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, vol. 196, pp. 420-424. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1097/NMD.0b013e31816ff3a1>
- [30] Ramírez, L. C. C., 2008. "Tecnologías terapéuticas: sistemas de interpretación en la regla de ocha y el Espiritismo bogotano." *Antípoda - Revista de Antropología y Arqueología*, vol. 6, pp. 133-152. Available: <https://doi.org/10.7440/antipoda6.2008.07>
- [31] Greenfield, S., 2009. "Our science is better than yours: Two decades of data on patients treated by a kardecist-spiritist healing group in rio grande do sul 1." *Anthropology of Consciousness*, vol. 20, pp. 101-110. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1556-3537.2009.01013.x>
- [32] Isaia, A., 2009. "O espiritismo nas teses da faculdade de medicina do rio de janeiro." *História Revista*, vol. 12, Available: <https://doi.org/10.5216/hr.v12i1.6848>
- [33] Moreira-Almeida, A. and Koss-Chioino, J., 2009. "Recognition and treatment of psychotic symptoms: Spiritists compared to mental health professionals in puerto rico and Brazil." *Psychiatry, Interpersonal and Biological Processes*, vol. 72, pp. 268-283. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1521/psyc.2009.72.3.268>
- [34] Alvarado, C., 2010. "Divisions of personality and spiritism' by Alfred Binet (1896)." *History of Psychiatry*, vol. 21, pp. 487-500. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957154X10380513>
- [35] Santo, D. E., 2010. "Who else is in the drawer?' Trauma, personhood and prophylaxis among Cuban scientific Spiritists." *Anthropology and Medicine*, vol. 17, pp. 249-259. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13648470.2010.526497>
- [36] Silva, L. and Elias, A., 2010. "Fé, Ciência e Ética: Uma discussão sobre células-tronco do ponto de vista do Espiritismo." *Revista do Núcleo de Estudos de Religião e Sociedade*, Available: <http://ken.pucsp.br/nures/article/view/4395>
- [37] Jabert, A., 2011. "Estratégias populares de identificação e tratamento da loucura na primeira metade do século XX: uma análise dos prontuários médicos do Sanatório Espírita de Uberaba." *História, Ciências, Saúde-Manguinhos*, vol. 18, pp. 105-120. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1590/s0104-59702011000100007>
- [38] Jabert, A. and Facchinetti, C., 2011. "A experiência da loucura segundo o Epiritismo: uma análise dos prontuários médicos do Sanatório Espírita de Uberaba." *Revista Latinoamericana de Psicopatologia Fundamental*, vol. 14, pp. 513-529. Available: <https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S1415-47142011000300008>
- [39] Míkola, N., 2011. "A inserção da homeopatia no Brasil e o espiritismo como estratégia de legitimação. 1860-1890." *Revista Brasileira de História das Religiões*, vol. 3, Available: <http://www.dhi.uem.br/gtreligiao/pdf8/ST1/003%20-%20Nadia%20Mikola.pdf>
- [40] Pereira Neto, A. F. and Amaro, J. S., 2012. "O Centro Espírita Redemptor e o tratamento de doença mental, 1910-1921." *História, Ciências, Saúde - Manguinhos*, vol. 19, pp. 491-508. Available: <https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0104-59702012000200008>
- [41] Wolfram, H., 2012. "Hallucination or materialization? The animism versus Spiritism debate in late-19 th - century Germany." *History of the Human Sciences*, vol. 25, pp. 45-66. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0952695112439375>
- [42] Bragdon, E. and Azevedo, J. L., 2013. "Mental healthcare in Brazil's spiritist psychiatric hospitals." *Journal for Spiritual and Consciousness Studies*, vol. 36, pp. 6-16. Available: <http://thegroundoffaith.net/issues/2013-06/%232%20Bragdon%20aticle.pdf>

- [43] Le Maléfan, P., Evrard, R., and Alvarado, C., 2013. "Spiritist delusions and Spiritism in the nosography of French psychiatry (1850–1950)." *History of Psychiatry*, vol. 24, pp. 477-491. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957154X13503094>
- [44] Lucchetti, G., Daher, J., Iandoli, D., Gonçalves, J., and Lucchetti, A. L. G., 2013. "Historical and cultural aspects of the pineal gland: comparison between the theories provided by Spiritism in the 1940s and the current scientific evidence." *Neuro Endocrinology Letters*, vol. 34, pp. 745-55. Available: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24522019>
- [45] Lucchetti, G., de Oliveira, R., Gonçalves, J., Ueda, S., Mimica, L., and Lucchetti, A. L. G., 2013b. "Effect of Spiritist “passe” (Spiritual healing) on growth of bacterial cultures." *Complementary Therapies in Medicine*, vol. 21, pp. 627-632. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ctim.2013.08.012>
- [46] Weber, B. T., 2013a. "ESpiritismo e Saúde: concepções a partir das práticas numa sociedade kardecista." *Revista Brasileira de História das Religiões*, vol. 5, pp. 19-46. Available: <https://doi.org/10.4025/rbhranpuh.v5i15.30222>
- [47] Weber, B. T., 2013b. "Medicina intuitiva, homeopatia e eSpiritismo na Revue Spirite -1858-1869." *Revista Territórios and Fronteiras*, vol. 6, Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22228/rt-f.v6i2.233>
- [48] Brancaccio, M., 2014. "Enrico morselli's psychology and “spiritism”: Psychiatry, psychology and psychical research in Italy in the decades around 1900." *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science Part C: Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences*, vol. 48, pp. 75-84. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.shpsc.2014.08.002>
- [49] Graus, A., 2014. "Hypnosis in Spain (1888–1905): From spectacle to medical treatment of mediumship." *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science Part C: Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences*, vol. 48, pp. 85-93. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.shpsc.2014.07.002>
- [50] Lucchetti, Peres, M., Vallada, H., and Lucchetti, G., 2015. "Spiritual treatment for depression in Brazil: An experience from spiritism." *Explore*, vol. 11, pp. 377-386. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.explore.2015.07.002>
- [51] Saad, M., Lucchetti, G., Peres, M. F., and de Medeiros, R., 2015. "Toward the concept of 'spiritist chaplaincy'." *J. Relig Health*, vol. 54, pp. 1460-9. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-015-0011-z>
- [52] Anefalos, A., Silva, W., Pinto, R., Ferrari, R., de Fátima Boni, A., and dos Santos, H., 2016. "Experience of the spiritist hospital chaplaincy service: A retrospective study." *Journal of Religion and Health*, vol. 55, pp. 909-917. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-015-0106-6>
- [53] Bastos Jr., M., Bastos, P., Osório, I., Muass, K., Iandoli Jr., D., and Lucchetti, G., 2016. "Frontal electroencephalographic (EEG) activity and mediumship: a comparative study between Spiritist mediums and controls." *Archives of Clinical Psychiatry (São Paulo)*, vol. 43, pp. 20-26. Available: <https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/0101-60830000000076>
- [54] Carneiro, É., Moraes, G., and Terra, G., 2016. "Effectiveness of spiritist passe (spiritual healing) on the psychophysiological parameters in hospitalized patients." *Advances in Mind-Body Medicine*, vol. 30, pp. 4-10. Available: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/27874837>
- [55] Cavalcante, R. S., Banin, V., de Moura, R. P. N., Daher, S., Habermann, M., and Habermann, F., 2016. "Effect of the Spiritist “passe” energy therapy in reducing anxiety in volunteers: A randomized controlled trial." *Complementary Therapies in Medicine*, vol. 27, pp. 18-24. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ctim.2016.05.002>
- [56] Gyimesi, J., 2016. "Why ‘Spiritism’?" *The International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, vol. 97, pp. 357-383. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-8315.12364>
- [57] Vancini, R. L. L., Claudio, A. B., Vancini-Campanharo, C. R., Barbosa, D. A., and Arida, R. M., 2016. "The Spiritism as therapy in the health care in the epilepsy." *Revista Brasileira de Enfermagem*, vol. 69, pp. 804-810. Available: <https://dx.doi.org/10.1590/0034-7167.2016690425i>
- [58] Alminhana, L., Farias, M., Claridge, G., Cloninger, C., and Moreira-Almeida, A., 2017. "Self-directedness predicts quality of life in individuals with psychotic experiences: A 1-year follow-up study." *Psychopathology*, vol. 50, pp. 239-245. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1159/000474951>
- [59] Carneiro, É., Barbosa, L., Marson, J., Terra, J., Martins, C., and Modesto, D., 2017. "Effectiveness of Spiritist “passe” (Spiritual healing) for anxiety levels, depression, pain, muscle tension, well-being, and physiological parameters in cardiovascular inpatients: A randomized controlled trial." *Complementary Therapies in Medicine*, vol. 30, pp. 73-78. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ctim.2016.11.008>
- [60] Moraes, A. T., 2017. "O discurso da saúde no eSpiritismo: Do magnetismo à autocura." *Religare: Revista do Programa de Pós-Graduação em Ciências das Religiões da UFPB*, vol. 14, pp. 90-108. Available: <https://doi.org/10.22478/ufpb.1982-6605.2017v14n1.34213>
- [61] Saad, M. and de Medeiros, R., 2017a. "Potential contribution of the medical-spiritist model to a new paradigm on Medicine." *Int. J. ComplementAlt Med.*, vol. 8, p. 00262. Available: <https://doi.org/10.15406/ijcam.2017.08.00262>
- [62] Saad, M., de Medeiros, R., and Mosini, A. C., 2017b. "Fading away the borders between religion and science: The proposal from the spiritist medical model." *Journal of Clinical Research and Bioethics*, vol. 8, pp. 313-5. Available: <https://doi.org/10.4172/2155-9627.1000313>
- [63] Bastos Jr., M., Bastos, P., Osório, I., Pinheiro, S., Iandoli, D., and Lucchetti, G., 2018. "Physiologic correlates of culture-bound dissociation: A comparative study of Brazilian Spiritist mediums and controls." *Transcultural Psychiatry*, vol. 55, pp. 286-313. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461518759202>

- [64] Carneiro, É., Barbosa, L., Bittencourt, A., Hernández, C., Timóteo, R., and Almeida, C., 2018a. "Effects of Spiritist "passe" (Spiritual healing) on stress hormone, pain, physiological parameters and length of stay in preterm newborns: a randomized, double-blind controlled trial." *Journal of Complementary and Integrative Medicine*, vol. 15, Available: <https://doi.org/10.1515/jcim-2018-0015>
- [65] Carneiro, É., Borges, R., de Assis, H., Bazaga, L., Tomé, J., and da Silva, A., 2018b. "Effect of Complementary Spiritist Therapy on emotional status, muscle tension, and wellbeing of inpatients with HIV/AIDS: A randomized controlled trial – single-blind." *Journal of Complementary and Integrative Medicine*, vol. 16, Available: <https://doi.org/10.1515/jcim-2018-0057>
- [66] Facchinetti, C. and Jabert, A., 2018. "Combining psychiatry and Spiritism: Therapies employed in a Brazilian sanatorium (1934–1948)." *History of Psychology*, vol. 21, pp. 208-222. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1037/hop0000101>
- [67] Lambe, J., 2018. "In the shadow of the double: Psychiatry and spiritism in cuba." *History of Psychology*, vol. 21, pp. 223-239. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1037/hop0000034>
- [68] Pierini, E., 2018. "Healing and therapeutic trajectories among the spirit mediums of the Brazilian vale do amanhecer." *International Journal of Latin American Religions*, vol. 2, pp. 272-289. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s41603-018-0054-5>
- [69] Sedran, P., Carbonetti, A., and Allevi, J., 2018. "Juan P. Quinteros, espiritista. Disputas por los sentidos legítimos del arte de curar. Santa fe, fines del siglo xix." *Revista de Indias*, vol. 78, pp. 819-843. Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.3989/revindias.2018.025>
- [70] Zacaron, K. A. M., Mendes, N. S., Silva, Y. C., and Lucchetti, G., 2018. "Effects of laying on of hands with and without a spiritual context on pain and functionality of older women with knee osteoarthritis: study protocol for a randomized controlled trial." *Journal of Integrative Medicine*, vol. 16, pp. 106-112. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joim.2018.02.002>
- [71] Carneiro, É., Tosta, A., Antonelli, I., Soares, V., Oliveira, L., and Borges, R., 2019. "Effect of spiritist "passe" on preoperative anxiety of surgical patients: A randomized controlled trial, double-blind." *Journal of Religion and Health*, Available: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-019-00841-7>
- [72] Weber, B. T., 2019. "Vínculos entre homeopatia e eSpiritismo no Rio Grande do Sul na passagem para o século XX." *História, Ciências, Saúde - Manguinhos*, vol. 26, pp. 1299-1315. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0104-59702019000400016>