



# Power of IctS in the Metanarrative of Migration Globalization and Trafficking: Are Digitals and Nation-States the Current Cyborgs of Internationalization?

Pr. Alfred Ndi

École Normale Supérieure, Bambili Campus, University of Bamenda, Republic of Cameroon

## Abstract

This paper drew from critical theory and creative works of art to assess the nation state and globalization contexts of migration and trafficking and came to the conclusion that there is an ambivalent relationship existing between the use of ICTs and nation state contexts. Migration and trafficking are not only constructed by economic but also by political, social, cultural and psychoanalytical factors. The paper argued that the factors have to be imputed into any ICT technologies to emerge with a cyborg model of combatting migration and trafficking. Nevertheless, there is no direct, mechanical relationship regulating the two spheres of cybernetic and human experience.

**Keywords:** Migration; Trafficking; ICTs; Nation-state; Globalization; Despair; Conflict and critical perspectives.

## 1. Introduction

There is an ambivalent link existing between Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) and the global discourse of nation state migration, trafficking and impasse. Consequently, the challenge is what model of ICTs and nation states should be deployed to manage the latter. ICTs intersect with nation state migration and trafficking metanarrations in ways that are undecidable to global outcomes. In today's global world of neoliberal capitalism, migrants are very mobile and yet maintain family relationships, support their families economically, and sustain their cultural identity, etc through the Internet while they are living abroad (Noh *et al.*, 2012). But, there is also no doubt that the Internet greatly increases the range of available options for international traffickers to exploit, and this complicates the task of humanitarian organizations working to check the impact of this practice. Often, international humanitarian law alone cannot protect the rights of migrants, but ICTs can assist with the creation of migration regimes that are more transparent. They can be utilized to track down locations of migrants, for example. At an international conference on migration and attainment of the post-2015 global development goals, specialists suggested that nation states should ensure that migrants were respected, protected and could access justice (Castles, 2013; Rosenblum and Ball, 2016). Although a UN conference proposed the notion of setting up a multilateral system of migration governance that is cooperative and equitable, these ideas were seen right away as good news for the 232 million migrants worldwide (Ibid) but nothing was said about ICT strategies because their deployment does not have direct measurable effects. Political will is necessary to impact directly on the situation of migrants but ICTs have a greater potential to play critical and more complex roles to completely change global migration governance by communicating to migrants the ways the international system works, tracking the courses of refugees and migrants, making the international system accountable and transparent, etc. ICTs can assist migrants with the information and knowledge they need to move to their destinations, in terms of legal requirements, safe routes, level of risks in dealing with illegal operators and human traffickers, clandestine border crossing, prevention of desperate actions taken by migrants while crossing borders such as sneaking through barbed wire fences, stowing away aboard crowded boats, etc. However, the big question is how can ICTs be managed as tools of interactivity to each day deconstruct the increasing effects of migration and trafficking, which have been captured in artistic writings?

During the past decades, the *effects* of human trafficking, although not new, were the subject of reinforced legislation designed to combat them through, for example, criminalization of the phenomenon, its active agents, and enhancement of rights and support for its victims. Whilst, for some, this was the most appropriate direction to follow, for others their feeling was that other aspects should be taken into consideration in order to make these measures and protection truly effective. Firstly, the initiatives and political strategies designed to combat trafficking, in particular, sex trafficking, did not meet with any consensus on a definition of this specific type of trafficking. In fact, competing definitions could easily be found and there was little agreement among researchers and activists about what methods to use. Broader or more restricted definitions of the concept of sex trafficking influenced, from the outset, the figures that were presented and, subsequently, the measures that were designed to combat it. It was really difficult to find precise, solid and reliable figures for sex trafficking, whether on a national, continental or worldwide level, and this led to two extreme positions which, as such, effectively did little to help trafficked women. Each international organisation presented figures that varied by thousands or even by millions; some referred to very high figures, whilst others contested the figures and believed that sex trafficking was a minor phenomenon. Both positions contained the risk of denying women's self-determination, by assuming that trafficking existed in situations of aid to illegal immigration or voluntary prostitution. The second risk consisted in not assisting women

who were really in danger (Yazgan *et al.*, 2015). So, the critical question is what model of usage of ICTs can engender efficient and optimal outcomes to fight trafficking in migration and therefore promote development? In order to answer this question, we must first of all understand the global factors that construct migration and trafficking.

Today, migrants' human rights are being compromised globally at several phases of their journeys, whether at the stage of leaving their homes, at the borders, when working in the host country or while returning home or during the course of being deported home. Unfortunately, the use of online technologies allows traffickers to have access to a greater number of victims, to advertise their services over larger spatial distances and to traffic victims worldwide. The diffusion of different types of e-technology and websites (e.g. adult classified websites, social network sites, pre-paid cellular phones) allows traffickers to develop complex recruitment strategies that are difficult to detect (Latonero *et al.*, 2015), even though the technologies themselves can be deployed to the advantage of law enforcement (Latonero *et al.*, 2015). One of the key benefits of computer-assisted technology is the possibility to identify possible cases of trafficking within a large data corpus, which is particularly helpful given the sheer mass of activity on social networking sites such as Twitter, currently estimated at 500 million Tweets per day (Zagheni *et al.*, 2014). In addition to this crisis, current technical expertise has not yet developed appropriate data reduction and analysis techniques. There are limited, though innovative, attempts to investigate the ways in which social networking sites can be used to identify possible victims (Latonero *et al.*, 2012).

## 2. Methodology

In order to answer these questions, this paper draws from a critical framework and methodology based on the Frankfurt and other Schools with Theodor W. Adorno, Max Horkheimer, Jürgen Habermas, Herbert Marcuse and Karl Marx as a normative project, with a political engagement (Held, 1980; Macey *et al.*, 2001; Marx, 1867/1976; Wiggershaus, 1994). The conflict framework is an approach to explain migration and trafficking based on the fundamental idea that crime is caused by economic drives within society. It explains the thoughts and reasoning behind human trafficking by maintaining that it is a question of struggles between classes, between victims and traffickers. The conflict perspective of society stresses the existence of different value systems and norms that influence efforts of people to enforce rules and regulate comportment behaviours. Karl Marx's concept surrounding social conflict states that there is a constant conflict between two groups. We cannot think of more conflict than that of a victim at the hands of a perpetrator. In all societies, one of the most important status groups for determining people's chances in life has been their gender. In almost every case, women are marked as inferior to men in terms of their access to wealth, power, autonomy, and other valued resources, in almost no case are they superior (Skrobanek *et al.*, 1997). The conflict framework explains that the powerful and the haves are able to take things from the haves-not through economic methods or with force. Human trafficking is able to do both. In all trafficking scenarios, the traffickers are men and the victims are women, and often times children. The focus here is on separating the powerful from the haves-not, taking away their family, tradition and connections to community. The general idea behind social conflict theory on human trafficking is that traffickers, who are the more powerful group, employ their power to exploit groups with less power than themselves. As for the victims of trafficking, and separation between the classes, society created a division between the classes. The theory therefore implies that society cannot stop until poverty and other classes/ divisions are rectified. So long as traffickers have money, victims passports, there is no way for the women/children to get out, without money, so they try and work their way out with prostitution and the cycle continues seamlessly, because traffickers make the rules and control families. Conflict theory explains trafficking in women and children in terms of Marxist economism.

## 3. Findings

Diome (2003), bridges the gap of *uncertainty* in migration after a very long silence since the departure of Issa and Lamine through a phone call which Koromax receives from them when they reach Spain. "les garçons étaient à la croix-Roguse espagnole, ils appelleraient les parents, sur leur portable pour ceux qui en avaient un, au télé centre pour les autres" (Diome, 2003) This phone call links Spain and the families of the migrants thereby creating a global city. As soon as Issa and Lamine arrive in Spain, the news comes to Koromax right to Guelwaar village and he uses it to assure the two mothers who are already worried about the conditions of their sons. "Non, en Espagne, ils sont arrivés en Espagne et ils ont téléphoné, quelqu'un est venu me le dire tout à l'heure" (p. 182). But not so with Miranda Musonge when, in Ngwa and Ngwa (2006). *From Dust to Snow: Bush-faller*, she moves from Africa to a developed country with its new technological facilities. The first contact she has is with the escalators which she has witnessed only on television. She falls the first time she stepped on them and becomes very scared after. She tries to avoid it but could not go without it for long. In New York, Miranda has to face the baggage carousel. She says "It seemed like a rattling python continuously spewing the luggage of hundreds of passenger who stopped to collect" (p. 104) This frightful African image of a venomous python Miranda uses means that what she is still carrying along is the old African primitive wild milieu which would need time to become used to the new technology of the developed American society and off course will block or slow down Miranda's progress abroad. Miranda finds herself in the "driver's seat" when she finally moves to the university, UGLA in USA. She has nobody by her on whom she can depend for anything not even communication. Miranda says "when you call someone, you meet an answering machine even on the cell phone" (p. 106).

Miranda feels that the cell phone could connect her to the rest of the world and so solve her problem of loneliness and lack of connection, but in a different social milieu, it is different. It is, however, very important for Miranda to stay in contact with her family and friends through email and telephone calls. This later on helps her to

overcome “loneliness and homesickness, academic difficulties, confusion with American culture, anxiety, relationship problems, and prospects of depression”( p. 106). New technology therefore provides solutions to the migrant’s problems. It may be very difficult at the start when the migrant is still struggling to learn it but later on, it becomes a necessity as it brings Africa closer to the migrant. But communication also poses a lot of problems to the African migrant. Miranda, as an example, has to master the difference between American and British English. She has to become acquainted with the type of English (expressions and words) used in the American society. The lengthy greetings in the Cameroonian society have to be replaced by a little “*hello, how are you?*”(p. 106). The migrant’s accent and skin colour cause a problem and reduce his/her personality. Miranda expresses or wishes to have been where her accent is just right and the skin colour is the only way to be and where one speaks and everyone understands one. Debbie, needs to learn how to spell words and speak the American way. Her dictionary is very different from that of the Americans and she is mocked and ridiculed for it. I “felt even worse when my roommates invented Debbie’s Dictionary; a list of all the words I said that are different such as: biscuits =cookies (in the US), chips=fries, bonnet=hood (of car), trousers (pants), etc I began to feel alone and different.” (p. 114). Language and culture forms part of social integration. Debbie will not go far off if she would not devote time to solve this problem, which she brought from Kenya. In Benin MS, Chieze uses information technology to apply for a school in the United States. he writes a lot of applications, S.A.T exams, recommendation letters and essay writing online. As an African, Chieze carries on a mental expedition to the United States for admission and the admission is granted. The use of ICT enables communication all over the world. The migrant does not need to take a plane to America to seek admission into a school. When Chieze reveals that he is from Nigeria, an individual poses a question to him “*Oh Nigeria, really? Where in Texas is that?*” and then there are questions that are so stereotypical that could only be asked in the context of the film. “So do you all live in trees? You have internet in Nigeria? (p. 111). The series of question means that Africa is unknown to Nigeria and only new technology can make Africa especially Nigeria familiar to the rest of the world, without which only Americans who have travelled to Africa or Nigeria will know about it. This individual in America will be satisfied if the reality about Africa is exposed to him through the internet for example. Victor Mbah reveals that it is very difficult to find a job in America without technological aptness “coming from Cameroon you lack technological adeptness that is often required in the US. Even with cleaning jobs, the cleaning equipment is more sophisticated than at home where you can use your hand to mop the flour without raising any eyebrows.” (p. 121)

The African migrant spends time to learn the new technology in the American society before they can progress. Information and communication technology exposes life in the receiving country to the aspiring migrant which helps them to equip themselves before migration so as to avoid hurdles in the destination country that would delay their progress. Ignatius Bakia while in Germany “tried a distance learning course on computers in England and even successfully completed one level and have a diploma for it” (p. 115). New technology enables Bakia to acquire a diploma through e-education. If he could do this from Africa or Cameroon where he is coming from, it would have saved him from much of the inhuman treatment he went through in the hands of the German immigration police. Karen travels to London after her advanced level to further her studies. Her cousins are to welcome her at the airport immediately she arrives but unfortunately, for Karen her cousins are nowhere to be found when she arrives. After waiting in vain for about 20minutes, Karen decides to move to a phonebooth around to make a call to her cousins but unfortunately, she could not manipulate the phone. Karen is stranded here and is only able to make her way out by following instruction through the speaker on how to get to the nearest train station. Lack of knowledge on how to operate the phone blocks communication between this migrant and her family, leading her to the first shock she meets in London

*It was 20 minute past my arrival time, but there was no one at the airport. I could recognize. I turned and saw a phone booth and thought of making a phone call. I couldn't because I didn't know how to use it. It wasn't like the booths we had in Cameroon. I looked to see if anyone had a 'kind' countenance, so I could walk up to him or her and ask for help. I didn't see anyone who I could boldly walk up to. I stood there with my luggage at my feet, looked round and decided to make enquires about how to get to my new home. Ngwa and Ngwa (2006)*

Karen’s presence in a strange land with strange technology and strange people, is an indication that technology hinders the migrant’s prospects. This is certainly a sign to Karen that for her to succeed in her studies in London she would certainly need to face the challenges of strange people and strange technology. Karen’s attention would certainly be diverted from education to learning how to use the phones first, and other forms of technology. When asked to move out from where they are living by the landlord, Karen and her cousins take some time searching through newspaper and on internet for housing. The internet therefore plays a great role in migration. The time Karen takes searching for house on the internet is time she would take to study. This paints a society where e-management is very significant. The length of time Karen and her cousin take to search for this information is an indication that the internet is either not solely reliable or they are not yet efficient in using it. In order for migration to lead to development therefore, there is need to intensity e-management through different strategies and controls.. “We had been looking for affordable housing where we could move into with no success. We often got worried as we spent time searching through newspapers and on the internet for housing to no avail”(p. 42). The only decision Karen and cousins could arrive at after the long search was to do this in the evening after school. It hinders them from progressing in their education, which was their reason for travelling to London. Internet makes the migrant to be frauded of their money to solve the nostalgia problem. Karen resolves to make frequent phone calls and emails home. “Within weeks of my arrival in England, I started missing my family, close friends and even home foods. I emailed friends at least twice a week to tell them what it was like and how I felt. I called my parents once in two weeks, because dad would always say I was spending too much money calling home.”(p. 45). Karen will soon

get into financial crisis because the society in which she is found provides the means by which money issued even unconsciously to solve migration problems like nostalgia and loneliness.

Robinson Muwanka in the midst of financial stress in Sweden finds solace in free internet and computer in Ngwa and Ngwa (2006). *From Dust to Snow: Bush-faller*. The first thing that his program coordinator gives him is the key to the computer laboratories in which Robinson is exposed to 24 hour/24 free internet. Robinson uses the computer as a past time activity to hide this frustration. "Most of my difficulties and frustrations were buried on the keyboard. Honestly speaking, the computer came my greatest companion no friends, no relatives what a style of life indeed! The role of ICT in migration is therefore very crucial. It keeps the migrant company as well as blocks his progress in Europe. In a society where the Europeans prefer to spend time playing with their pets to sitting down to chat with friends (p. 51), the African culture of sharing one another's burden is very absent in Europe. ICT would therefore replace family members and relatives in the life of the migrant and would help lighten his burden. The migrant also needs to take time learning these new technologies. These are unforeseen factors or activities that are bound to slowdown the migrant's progress and which are very crucial in his progress: "the technological differences are innumerable. Sweden is so technologically advanced so that machines stand to do almost we very thing. Get to a fuel station you find there is nobody to attend to you. You just slot in your card and pump you fuel yourself (p. 54). Ambe gets into a serious dilemma in his first lesson in the Vaasa polytechnic in Finland where everything had to be done on the computer. He says this "in computer classes, every student had a computer to himself. I was impressed and felt stupid. Why? I left Cameroon without any knowledge of how key board looked like the teacher would say press control and I would have no idea. I typed like a sick chicken trying to eat maize" (p. 63). Lack of knowledge of the computer is very challenging to Ambe and he needs to spend time to equip himself with computer skills before continuing with his studies at Vaasa polytechnic. The challenge Ambe faces from minors in the class during lectures pushes him to spend sleepless nights trying to catch-up with computer studies. It is only at the end of the second semester in year one that Ambe masters the computer. This process slows down the migrant's academic project and hinders his development and progress. Lack of computer knowledge in the country experiencing high level of technology can hinder or block the aspiring migrant who has to compete with students who had computers as toys when growing up. Joe touches a computer for the first time at the age of 18 (p. 77). In his account of his studies in Germany, he regrets the fact that Africa does not have the new technological facilities that Europe has: 'The migrant in Europe would progress faster if computer skills were transferred to him early from his African society, or by parents at home, just like the white children in his class whose parents bought them computer when they were growing up.'

Another aspect of technology that migrants in Europe face is ignorance of the use of different gadgets or numerous electronic devices. These are normal devices that are used for day to day transactions in Germany and elsewhere in Europe and America. Akong, a female pharmacy student in Kiel, Germany recounts her ignorance of the use of these devices and refers to it as the worst form of poverty (Ngwa and Ngwa, 2006). *From Dust to Snow: Bush-faller*. She tends to blame her country for contributing to her ignorance. "Coming from Cameroon I suffered from the technology ignorance. I felt ashamed at first when I did not know how to use the different gadgets (numerous electronic devices) for day-to-day life but released it was normal that I did not know how to use what I had never used before, like cash dispenser" (p. 88). Akong throws her blame on her country in which many students do not have bank accounts that could have led them to use these electronic devices. Akong is ridiculed and intimidated in Germany in her attempts to ask for help on the use of these devices. In a society where some people do not even know Africa is a continent, the language spoken in Africa and even the origin of the black colour; how would Akong ask for help or learn day-to-day technology from the people? This poor knowledge of technology in running day-to-day life in Germany is a hindrance to Akong's development in the society. Daniel in the same German society says one cannot progress without the knowledge of the computer and the internet in Germany. There is access to technology but the migrant needs money. Daniel cannot progress because he has no passwords to the university computer centre (p. 95). The Western society is characterized by the use of information and communication technology but when it is made to be so expensive, it is to send away the young migrants who are struggling to acquire skills in the society. So only those who can afford to pay for the high level technology will succeed fast. Miranda Musonge also comments that the use of email or phone calls help to overcome loneliness and homesickness, academic difficulties, confusion with American culture, anxiety, relationship problems and prospect of depression" (p. 107). ICT is therefore an essential tool for the migrant's life and success in Europe and America and the lack of access or the knowledge of it would block or even kill migrants through depression.

Human trafficking surfaces up as an issue that is closely linked to migration, for example, formulating a legislative response to: the control of state borders, the fight against terrorism and the way in which each country deals with prostitution. As some authors argue (e.g. Breuil *et al.* (2011), Ford *et al.* (2012) and (Pajnik, 2010), the management of migration and the inevitable fight against human trafficking may have different impacts in different countries in the global North and South. These two aspects converge, mostly in what concerns the legal sphere, in the form of a significant discrepancy between what is prescribed in legislation and its practical application, which is full of stereotypes and preconceptions. The law, comprehended here as both the text of the law and judicial practice, is therefore faced with major obstacles in terms of the role it can and/or could play in the fight against human trafficking. Sex trafficking is not an isolated problem existing in a vacuum; its causes are intrinsically linked to other social, economic, political and cultural phenomena, meaning that in several cases, it does not just involve a violation of rights resulting from trafficking. This explains why it is deeply embedded in the way society is structured out. Slavery is a social practice that granted rights of ownership to a human being over another human being, and was common in history throughout the world from antiquity. The transnational slave trade which started with European expansionism and formation of the core/periphery world system at the end of the Fifteenth century, the seafaring

voyages of Portugal and Castile, in what some authors have called the first modernity (see (Mignolo, 2007), is profoundly entrenched as Lawrence Hill's (2010) *The book of negroes: a novel*, demonstrates (Medovarski, 2013). When Lawrence Hill (2010) wrote his *The book of negroes: a novel*, with sensitivity to victims of trafficking, it became a bestselling novel, garnering praise and awards in many countries such as the Rogers Writers' Trust Fiction Prize, the Commonwealth Writers' Prize and the CBC Canada Reads. The remarkable protagonist of this text Aminata Diallo becomes a heroine who bravely confronts the Eighteenth-century world which was hostile to the black colour and sexuality. Aminata Diallo is abducted at the age of eleven years when she is a child from her village in West Africa and is tasked to work on an indigo plantation in South Carolina, Aminata survives because she remembers the midwifery skills her mother taught her and because of her strong character. She registers her name in the *book of negroes*, a British military ledger that enables three thousand black loyalists to access passage on ships sailing to Nova Scotia from Manhattan. From the African village, where Aminata Diallo lived with her family to a plantation in the southern United States, and to take refuge in Nova Scotia and then Sierra Leone, we see a capitalist trajectory that is motivated by profit followed by the North/South restructuring of the world with the so-called back-to-Africa odyssey of a thousand two hundred former slaves. The world today functions on deeply drawn up lines separating the human from the subhuman world, in such a way that human principles are not threatened by inhumane practices. Thus, on the other side of the line we find a space which is a non-territory in legal and political terms, a space unthinkable in terms of the rule of law, human rights and democracy. Essentially, we find people who do not exist, either in social or legal terms. These spaces are constructed on the basis of new forms of slavery, the illegal trafficking of human organs, child labour and the exploitation of prostitution.

In *Trafficked*, for example, Bill Wallace tells the story of three such girls from Nigeria America, and India. It starts after they have been trafficked through an elaborate global network which involves illicit human, organ, and drug trafficking (Wallace and Zamora (2004)). All the three girls end up as sex slaves in a brothel in Texas. They then plot out their escape from enslavement in order to regain their freedom. The trafficking of people via the slave trade across the Atlantic therefore enters history, as Paul Gilroy argues in *The Black Atlantic*, as an economic and migratory flow that was an integral part of modernity (Gilroy, 2002). Today, the persistence of human trafficking shows that the abolition of slavery in various countries did not put an end to the plague of human trafficking, nor the place it occupied in modern economic and migratory routes. When one considers human trafficking and the ways the phenomenon has gained significance, one can also find transnational flows which follow the logic of economic gain without any respect for the self-determination of the human being. Although it is true that this unlawful phenomenon run by profit-driven organizations has a completely different role from that of slavery in the past, which was central to the formation of the world system, it is still inextricably linked to it. The point is that, whilst the practices of trafficking are not central to the global transnational markets or the global world in which we live today, as slavery once was, they are nevertheless embedded in the inequalities and injustices of the distribution of wealth promoted and encouraged by the world system. Thus, although colonial rule and the legitimate trading of individuals between countries have officially ended, the profound inequalities between North and South are nowadays the driving force behind the clandestine logic that leads to this tradition of sub-humanization of humans.

Having highlighted the problematic of human trafficking in migration as an economic *impasse*, we propose to investigate the *big picture* of migration, which can enable us to understand why this phenomenon persists and devise a model trajectory for the utilization of ICTs to address the stalemate. We hypothesize on the premise that human trafficking intensified because migration was focused chiefly on a *deterministic* vision of neo-classical and neoliberal economism. From this light, we suggest that in order to efficiently address this problematic, the world should move away from a reductionist deployment of economics to embrace a comprehensively political and therefore an interactive model. To address this problematic effectively, we have to answer the following research questions: what are the elements of the 'big picture' of migration? Which ICT tools and techniques can be employed to articulate this 'big picture'? How can we realize interactivity in ICT and migration?

Until very lately, the question of human migration and trafficking was assumed to be a chiefly gender based one of feminization and economic discrimination. Although women and girls form the vast majority of victims of migration and trafficking, it is important that ICTs go beyond this essentialistic discourse and integrate new discourses that ask new questions about the status of trafficked persons in terms of whether they are 'victims' or 'agents'. There should be greater assimilation of arguments that insist on gender inequality, patriarchy, feminization of poverty and global disparities. Although women and girls constitute about 80% of victims trafficked across international borders, today, boys are also being trafficked into countries like Nigeria, Ivory Coast and Benin for agricultural work (Usman, 2014). ICTs now need to shift from emphasis on economism to integrate patriarchalism responsible for promoting values of discrimination where socio-cultural values of patriarchy prevailed; the status of girls and women in these areas was lowered and they became vulnerable to trafficking, to work as domestic help as evidenced in the films *Born into Brothels*, or the film *The Girl Who Played with Fire, Trade*. Because they were usually withdrawn from school, lacked access to education and economic resources as in the film *Taken in Baker* (2013), they became susceptible to the tactics of traffickers.

Global configuration divides the world into women of the global South and women of the global North (supposedly not vulnerable to trafficking!). With the socio-economic disadvantages faced by women and girls of the global South constructed by global policies such as structural adjustment plans, relocation of firms and unfavourable trade agreements and the collapse of welfare programmes, these conditions further diminished the position of women and girls evidenced by the films *The Whistleblower* (Kondracki et al., 2011) , *The Day My God Died*. Consequently, they became a primary source of labour for the textile, toy, shoe and agribusiness sectors where they emerged as a new 'service class' of people in an expanding global cities landscape marked by demands for domestic services. With increased demand for low-wage workforces and a diminishing supply of global North women willing

to serve in these positions, global South women became very prone to exploitation. From this reality, a sub-discourse triggered off based on legal policies to dissuade women from taking illegal routes of migration. But this, in turn, triggered off other discourses such as hiring of services of professional and amateur smugglers at the service of traffickers.

There is the victim or agent status of trafficked girls and women; women/girls are coerced and battered into 'slavery' as labour such as prostitution narrated in *Born Into Brothels*. But this narrative also unleashed other discourses beyond questions of prostitution, forced marriages, domestic work, factory labour, etc, that illuminated the reasons for trafficking of men, women and children as positively a question of sex work, which may be voluntary or coerced as in *Eden*, *Fatal Promises* (2009); *Chosen on Youtube*; *A Dance for Bethany*. In these films, women are distinguished from children as in the film *Calcutta's Red Light Kids* (retrieved in *Freedocumentaries.org*) for the sake of autonomy. In the trafficking films where the discourse prioritizes boys as in *Kavi* (retrieved at *Kavithemovie.com*), the emphasis seems to be about the right of movement for a better livelihood and survivability followed by public outrage for the exploitative nature of the practice as in *The Candy Shop* and, in *The Dark Side of Chocolate*. Other narratives seem to turn away from the victimhood motif to the right of movement without being harassed by security agents or immigration officers. Here, the spotlight tilts towards the need to check and control human rights abuses and coercion rather than legitimate quests for work such as sex tourism. Today, the migration and trafficking discourse has coalesced around the victim/agency and coercion/consent categories of polarization (Kempadoo, 2005). NGOs have emerged such as the Human Rights Caucus, the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women influenced in 2000 the framing of the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. The Human Rights Caucus promoted the agency perspective according to which a distinction should be made between trafficking and prostitution. From this perspective, prostitution is perceived as a type of labour in its legitimate rights whereas the human trafficking perspective suggested notions of deception and coercion. Accordingly, the Human Rights Caucus concentrated on the protection of labour rights. In talking about the exploitation of labour, one cannot proceed onto discussion without talking about Karl Marx and his theory of value. Marx found that the dominant class in society was able to enjoy their arguably easy life, only by appropriating a surplus of labour of the oppressed class who produce the wealth. He argued that profit is the driving engine behind capitalist production through unpaid labour of workers. Marx believed that individuals hold labour power that the capitalist buys and has the right to make use of for a particular period in order for the individual to receive a wage. Whilst an individual could produce a product in a short amount of time often rather forced to work for longer. In other words, the capitalist is able to exploit the worker in order to gain profits which is in the form of surplus value, also known as unpaid labour.

This Marxist insight is evidence that the exploitation of labour is not a new phenomenon, it has been around since the start of humanity and especially from the Seventeenth century when the Slave Trade started. *The Marxist* concept of the primitive accumulation of capital helps us to understand better the emergence of this sub-humanization of which human trafficking is such a singular expression. For Marx, one of the conditions of capitalist wealth was the exploitation of labour. Although it is based on the idea of free labour, capitalism, in fact, has a tendency to use not only labour but also space, the surrounding environment and nature in a destructive way. Capital tends to weaken or destroy its own conditions of production, since the constant crises caused by increased costs always lead to new attempts to restructure the conditions of production in order to reduce costs. These conditions imply that everything should be treated as a commodity, including labour. These characteristics of capitalism were very evident in its early days of antiquity, when the accumulation of wealth presupposed, as already stated, slavery, pillage and later on colonisation. However, these forms of over-exploitation are not only confined to one phase of capitalism. Capitalist societies worldwide always need these and other forms of over-exploitation in order to maintain capital in the form that we know today. With the advent of neoliberal globalisation this has become even more evident.

There are three components of neoliberal globalisation which, although not promoting human trafficking, make its restriction more difficult, namely, the creation of a privatized global economy with lingering state control, in which local markets become interlinked. *Fatal Promises* with director *Fatal Promises* (2009) on modern human trafficking draws our attention on this point. The liberalisation of trade, involving the abating of borders for the circulation of people, goods and services that serve to create this global market is exemplified by *Fatal Promises* (2009) *Fatal Promises*; and the extension of production through foreign investment in multinationals. With particular regard to the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation, this has signified that, with diminished state control, a global sex industry emerged in which a particular group of people, namely women, were repeatedly exploited. This was facilitated by circulations in which people from the poorer countries migrated to labour in this form of industrial tourism, either willingly or against their will, and those from the Northern countries who travelled for recreational tourism, fuelled by foreign investment (Ashley Judd *Playground Project* retrieved in *Playgroundproject.com*, *Chosen* retrieved on *youtuber*). The logic and dynamics underpinning self-determination and emancipation involved in the sex industry which evade the web of trafficking should also be taken into account.

With the establishment of neoliberal globalization from the 1980s onwards, we have been witnessing the de-socialisation of capital, meaning that social rights can no longer be guaranteed, and this has been contributing towards the increased vulnerability of millions of people throughout the world. During the Twentieth century, creation of wealth was subject to state/non-state rules which facilitated redistribution of wealth and creation of secure conditions for populations that did not possess wealth, socio-economic rights like unemployment benefits, public health, education, social security, and so forth. Social re-distribution measures were vital in creating a safety net to alleviate forms of social risk, preventing humans from diminishing into profound poverty. This social net is today weakened to such an extent that, when faced with unemployment, even the middle classes of people find themselves in need of assistance. In a situation where regulations created at national level fail to yield expected

results, capitalism as a form of global economic organization remains in a more comfortable position from which it can continue to pursue its profit objective with consequences that are increasingly obvious. The great weakness of the system itself evidenced in the economic and financial crises of 2008 with collapse of major US companies is a classical example. In order to prevent economic collapse, the state supported a welfare system for capital, for example, for the big car industries, whereas it did not exist for citizens. This means that even in the richest country in the world, people were more vulnerable. The perception that the primitive accumulation of capital was an ongoing condition became evident because in different continents, one encountered forms of slave labour and over-exploitation of the labour force which was dragging certain groups of people into non-human conditions. In the films we exploited, indigenous African populations, Indians and women, were the prominent category of humans, who lost their legality, became people with no existence, and in the eyes of the world became 'invisible' migrants.

From this light, the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation should be understood, initially, from this perspective. There are women who are forced to work as prostitutes (against their will), and also situations in which female prostitutes are forced to work under conditions which they cannot choose. However, the new element which capitalism has added to slavery is that workers are *free* to sell their labour. Therefore, according to certain views, women should be free to sell their sexual availability as labour. This position is not consensual, however, in the forms of over-exploitation as in *Fatal Promises* (2009) of which sexual trafficking is one example, women who sell their sexual availability as labour are also forced to sell not only their availability, but their freedom and identity as well. Within this context of over-exploitation in the labour market, various activists (Ibid) argue that any policy designed to fight human trafficking must extend beyond criminalizing traffickers to strengthening the rights of immigrant workers. In the specific case of the trafficking of women for the purposes of sexual exploitation, various authors also argue that prostitution must be included in the judicial framework of countries and even forced seizure of 'bodies' for ideological reasons like terrorism, with the case of the Chibok girls in Nigeria still fresh in our minds. However, there are various interpretations of the course the law should take in this area: whilst some opinions veer towards criminalising prostitution (Jeffreys, 1999), others demand that prostitution be regulated as a form of employment (e.g. (Kempadoo, 2005)). This issue will be developed in the next section.

This paper investigated the 'big picture' of migration with the aid of critical creative art, to explain how Marxian primitive accumulation and how labour value triggered off human trafficking and led to an *impasse* in this age of globalization. The artistic works show that Marx's economic assumptions claiming that capitalist owners do not contribute anything to the production process is reductive and ill-placed to explain the prevalence of this phenomenon in today's world of development. They suggest that capitalists afforded a fair profit on trafficking because of the huge *risks* of capital investment that they took in human exploitation, and also because of the *efforts of management* that they made and which were due their pay. Thus, beyond economism, risks and management efforts (*Dark Side of Chocolate*) became new values of production in their own right that were monetizable. In this epoch of the global competitive market, the utility of the trafficked 'worker' increased and the productivity of the capitalist trafficker also increased proportionately in terms of output. Although clearly the works argue that the ethical value or the morality of their non-labour contributions to the marginal outputs declined (in the sense that spiritually, trafficking no matter its justification, remains an immoral act), the trafficking job itself increased its potential for income. In *The Dark Side of Chocolate*, for example, the capitalist is not exploiting the new type of 'worker'; the workers in *Chosen* actually see themselves as being assisted to escape from misery with a little revenue thanks to the 'goods' (child labour, sexual) that they can afford to produce or already have. Because the context of neo-liberal capitalism is one of power/knowledge, the services of labour/sex could not increase their share at the expense of capital without losing their own part of the bargain since they were in a position of powerlessness. In addition, the artistic creations show that time was a critical factor in trafficking because exploitation in the age of globalization is one that was dependent not only on the whole value of a product produced by the worker, but also on the currency of its value. Globalization minimized the value of sexuality and labour (with intensification, expansion and liberalization of prostitution and labour) to a point where even skilled labour with highest levels of certification was undervalued.

Creative art such as *The Dark Side of Chocolate* puts forth a model of exploitation that analyses new modes of a socialist production based on unequal ownership of physical labour skills and non-human property (land, means of production). This model of property rights replaces the surplus labour model of exploitation, and the labour theory of value (Roemer, 1986). This new model of exploitation proposes the absence of employment (slave/master) relations, where the exploited workers actually ameliorate their welfare conditions by 'taking' their own share of assets that are alienable or inalienable. The texts remind us that in all modes of production, namely, nomadic, chieftaincy, feudal, capitalist, socialist, etc, exploitation was carried out on the basis of inequitable distribution of property rights. This liberal account of exploitation explored by art commits itself to the primacy of personal rights and liberties and to individual choice as a critical explanatory datum Steiner (1984). In the works of art, the act of trafficking is portrayed as an interpersonal transfer which follows three possible trajectories, namely, donation, exchange and theft. Exchange takes place in *The Dark Side of Chocolate* as a voluntary bilateral transfer of labour or sexual service. In the text *Chosen*, the beneficiary capitalist receives a service at a value that is greater than zero but on a shared scale of value. In *A Dance for Bethany*, it is a unilateral/bilateral transfer; in *Fatal Promises* a voluntary/involuntary transfer and in *Playground Project*, for example, an equal/unequal transfer. Except in the case of exploitation by theft as portrayed in Olaudah Equiano's *The interesting narrative of the life of Olaudah Equiano, Or Gustavus Vassa, The African*, exploitative transfers are bilateral with labour/services transferred voluntarily at both unequal and greater-than-zero value. In *Playground Project*, there is a voluntary bilateral transfer of unequally valued labour/services in the sense that the possessors of both items (namely, child worker/woman and master trafficker) would voluntarily effect the transfer if the labour/services and conditions of transfer were of equal value.

So, in the texts, the possessor of the higher-value item, namely, labour/sex is seen (by the trafficker) as voluntarily making the transfer because they feel that the items being transferred and the conditions of transfer are of equal value. In the case of *The Dark Side of Chocolate*, the exploitation is facilitated because the owner of the labour/services believes it can be converted to an exchange in due course of time. In this course, both exploiters and the exploited voluntarily become exchangers when benefactors would not.

In *The Dark Side of Chocolate*, the exploitation transfers are voluntary, but one of the two transfers is unnecessary. The circumstances that occasioned exploitation were not the same as what triggered the exploitative transfers. The exploitative circumstance was owing to factors that went beyond what motivated individuals to engage in a non altruistic bilateral transfer comprised of exchanges and exploitations. They were not sufficient circumstances to bring about exploitative transfers. To further explain the occurrence of exploitative circumstances certain generalizations about social relations must be included, to supply generalizations about social institutions. Steiner (1984) examined the institutional conditions of exploitation and discovered that in general exploitation was considered as unjust, and to comprehend why it was necessary to look at the idea of a right, including the right to accept being exploited, which was an inviolable sphere of practical choice, the way liberal rights were enforced to create social and international institutions became critical. Institutional exploitation flourished because the mode of deprivation in exploitation was not the same thing as the mode of violation of rights. The outcomes from these differences between violations and deprivations promoted exploitation because rights violation (such as through theft) which is an act of bilateral relationship was less critical than exploitation which was trilateral. From a liberal viewpoint, exploitation involved parties such as the state, the exploited, the exploiter, and people who suffered from rights violations. The state had an interest to protect exploiters and the exploiter was not expected to withhold consent from exploiting owing to, for example, altruistic concerns. Consequently, it was not possible to rid off exploitation in a regime of *laissez-faire* that globalization represented because in this regime property rights belong to everybody and to everyone. Globalization is an epoch when the traditional liberalism of old based on non-interventionism in commercial activities is reinforced as the responsibility of the age of the individual, although it is clear in the texts that this is not enough (cf: Henry George and Herbert Spencer).

Most scholars tend to see migration from a narrow perspective of neoclassical and neoliberal economics and consequently to regard exploitation from an abstract viewpoint deduced from David Ricardo's theory of surplus-value (Elster, 1978). In this neoclassical economic perspective, exploitation is perceived as the unequal marginal productivity of workers *vis à vis* wages, to a point where wages are regrettably lower. From this regard, exploitation is viewed as occurring when a worker receives less wages than the value of his marginal product (Schumpeter, 1949). The neoclassical perspectives which underpin the readings of the writers and film producers identify with certain necessities for revenue redistribution to poor, and marginalized communities like those of Africa. However, writers like Zafirovski (2003) revisit the marginal productivity theory of 'just income' as something of a general principle which can be very unstable especially in competitive contexts of capital and labour such as globalization marked by deregulation. Consequently, exploitation was inevitable in the imperfect conditions of global capitalism marked by labour market monopsony, and cartellization. Firms like Nike and Gap Inc. made recourse to child labour, sweatshops with wages that could not enable them to attain local subsistence levels of livelihood. Working hours in Africa were much longer than those in western societies as in virtually all the films; work conditions in African factories were more unsafe and much unhealthy and the films portray cases where workers were unable to escape from inhuman conditions, workers died because of inaccessibility to the outside world. In the absence of regulation imposed by global forces of the free market, corporations secured labour and this lowered the bargaining power of workers, who were in adequate supply and could be easily dismissed and immediately replaced if they revolted.

The moral but weak response to this state of affairs was that despite the fluid context favouring companies from western nation states migrating to African countries, they were 'helping' African workers through the application of unequal human standards. The basis of the moral argument was that whenever people chose to work for low wages and in unsafe, dangerous conditions because this was their only alternative as opposed to real prospects of starvation or scavenging off from refuge dumps which were the pre-existing options. Another response to this response was that this state cannot be construed as free choice by the workers. The solution proposed was that any company that intends to sell its products in western societies must pay its workers' wages that meet standards in western countries and must adhere to same labour, environmental, health, and safety standards as in the latter. Although this solution carried a strong moral urge to ameliorate the quality of life for workers in less developed nation states, it was deferred by fresh arguments that implementation of such a policy would hurt the economies of less developed countries because it would discourage U.S. or European companies from migrating and investing in them. Milton Friedman was an economist who thought that such a policy would have that effect (Hawkins, 2015. An interview with Milton Friedman John Hawkins' Right Wing News". *Rightwingnews.com*. Retrieved 2015-10-20). From this light, any enforcement of the policy with a view to end perceived 'exploitation' would have caused corporations to recourse to return migration by pulling back to their developed nation states, and leaving their workers in a much worse situation. In this way, even with wage slavery, corporate outsourcing was seen as a solution to a possibly much worse off situation than a problem despite the influence of socialists, anarcho-syndicalists, etc. Labour emerged as a new kind of commodity, which was open to exploitation in the free market where it was sold, this time, by the 'worker' himself/herself.

Labour value as a commodity declined during the globalization epoch because the price of production them is not necessary and direct or mechanical connection between a good's value and whether/in what quantities, labour or other goods of higher order are applied to its production. A good cannot attain value because large quantities of labour or other economic goods are applied to its production. A product created thanks to investments in labour is

irrelevant for its value. No one asks for the history of a product as a way of determining its value; people consider chiefly the services that the product offers them and the services they would have to forgo if they did not have the product at their disposal. The quantities of labour or of other means of production applied to a production cannot be the determining factor in the value of a product. Adam Smith's labour theory of price and Karl Marx's theory of exploitation are divergent on this point. Adam Smith's labour theory of price contended that return on capital arises from the roundabout nature of production, which necessarily involves the passage of time. A steel ladder, for example, is produced and brought to market only if the demand supports the digging of iron ore, the smelting of steel, the machines that press that steel into ladder shape, the machines that make and help maintain those machines, etc. Roundabout processes, Böhm-Bawerk maintained, would lead to a price that pays for more than labour value, and this makes it unnecessary to postulate exploitation to understand the return on capital. In contrast, Marx argued that it is capital, not demand that creates, but labour that preserves the value of the commodities obtained prior to the actual process of production. But the worker is unable to add new labour, to create new value, without at the same time preserving old values, because the labour he adds must be of a specific useful kind, and he cannot do work of a useful kind without employing products as the means of production of a new product, and thereby transferring their value to the new product. This should be seen as a gift of nature which costs the worker nothing, although this is very advantageous to the capitalist because it preserves the existing value of his capital. Thus, without the necessary addition of human labour-power, the ore, steel and machines, etc, would not create any new value on their own, but would in fact gradually depreciate what value they originally possessed through the ravages of time and neglect. Once these materials are activated thanks to the labour process, their values are simply transferred from one 'commodity' to 'another' with no increase. In this sense, it is not the materials, but the 'labour-time' that is 'present' in a commodity that represents its score in value over the course of its production. Böhm-Bawerk's position in his positive theory of interest also proffers the argument that workers trade in their share of the 'end price' for the more certain wages paid by the entrepreneur. Entrepreneurs have given up a safer wage-earning job in order to take on the function of entrepreneur. In other words, profits compensate the entrepreneur for their willingness to bear *risk* and to 'wait' to receive income. In the context of, say, a waitress earning tips, the waitress herself is not a wage-earner; but the proprietor of the restaurant does not make off profit from the tips earned by the waitress. The waitress is basically an entrepreneur, who takes risks by assuming that 'with time', customers will sufficiently compensate him for the labour/services she provides, whereas the customers are under no legal obligation to do so. In this case, the waitress is making an investment of services in anticipation of future return from the customers. The waitress is remunerated by an cumulative amount of earnings from tips that exceed that the labour value she provided to customers, and this includes a return on the waitress's investment. In the event where the tips are not enough to provide this return on investment, the waitress would *rationally* seek to insert herself in another employment, such as a wage-earning job with prospects for compensation that do not incorporate the risk element or to attach herself to an entrepreneurial job with similar risk perspectives but that provide for a better return.

The Marxist perspective of development as primitive accumulation of capital with a view to exploitation is very susceptible to the Schumpeterian theorization of imperialism (Schumpeter, 1949). The mind-set of the imperialist is that the market returns to each one the exact value that they added into it. Capitalists see themselves as just individuals who save and do not take anything away from other communities or from their environment. From this light, capitalism has no internal flaws, no contradictions; etc but has to endure external threats. Consequently, the argument goes that there is no question of exploitation of the interest of the trafficked worker through capital because no one can explain how exploiters secured control of an initial set of 'capital' in the first place in order to exploit. The Marxist viewpoint cannot explain the origin of capital *per se*. As a result, the argument is pursued further that imperialism is not a necessarily the outcome of capitalism, nor is it the source of capitalism. Imperialism with its culminating example of globalization existed even before capitalism and the contemporary capitalist world trade system expanded to any extent as desired. Whenever imperialism takes place, its expansion has nothing to do with the intrinsic nature of capitalism nor does it have anything to do with capitalist market expansion. Thus, the narrative of the argumentation draws our attention to the point that there is a *subtle* distinction that should be made between exploitation (primitive accumulation) and imperialism. Capitalism does not need the violence of imperial history in order to dispossess a community and seduce them to enter into capitalist relations as labour, sex workers, etc with a view to overcome the fatal contradictions generated within its capitalist relations over time, as Marxism assumed. Rather, imperialism is an impulse pursued by the independent interests of the economic ruling class. It is the disposition of a state of arrangements to expand by coercion and without limitations. It is the heir of the absolute monarchical state, derived from the fighting instinct of domination which simply happens to have come into contact with the productive relations of capitalism as well as with multiples of other relations during this age of globalization.

The exploitation of human trafficking can take the form of sexual slavery, forced labour, surrogate child-bearing and even organ harvesting, as is the contemporary practice. But, another line of narrative thought is that regardless of the motives, it is a disfigurement of humanity even though combating it has proven to be a very frustrating task. Despite the best efforts of law enforcement, governments, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, and of anti-trafficking advocates, furthering progress against this scourge remains a critical humanitarian issue. Human trafficking is one of the largest, best-organized and most profitable types of crime, ranking behind only the illegal weapons and drug trades. It violates numerous national and international laws and has ensnared more than 25 million people around the world. This is why Microsoft believes that technologies of today's 'mobile-first, cloud-first' world should be deployed to assist with disrupting the globalized problem of human trafficking. Technology can not only make law enforcement more efficient, it can also be employed to educate those who are at risk and to inform their families, and can be oriented to disrupt criminal operations by increasing the risk and reducing the

rewards of their activities. With the best efforts of law enforcement, governments, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, and of anti-trafficking advocates, the bid to further progress against this scourge remains a critical humanitarian issue. The practice of human trafficking is large, well-organized and very profitable; but it does not cancel the fact that it is a crime, which stands at same level as illegal drug trading. It infringes on human value, involving transportation of victims illegally sometimes across national boundaries with falsified documents that look like legalized passports, visas, etc.

#### **4. Discussion**

ICTs can potentially track down the movements of migrants and this tracking can aid with the process of monitoring their human rights. For example, some South Asian states set up internet-based registration mechanisms to help their communities who wish to migrate with necessary information. The Bangladesh government created an online registration scheme that works with NGOs disseminating awareness about migration opportunities, job requirements, training needs, etc in rural and urban places (Kaiwa, 2017). These mechanisms informed by data could streamline migration, make it safer, and improve migrants' working and living conditions. In this way, mobile and internet technologies can enable us to track down migrants in real time, to know their whereabouts, identify their employment status and so forth. Migrants can employ text messages to update a central database that can be exploited by governments, NGOs, etc to keep an eye on migrants' situations, and provide them with advice or assistance. The ILO and International Organization for Migration can scale up these kinds of innovations to support the world's migrants and millions of refugees.

Although, technology facilitated things for traffickers to generate false travel documents, the same (new) technology can be developed to create new types of identifying documents that are difficult to falsify because they rely on information stored in databases unavailable to traffickers. An example of such a technology is the 'False and Authentic Document', an image archiving system that subjects documents to efficient verification and provides prompt notification to authorities whenever a falsified document is identified. The FADO database contains images of false and forged documents, genuine documents, summaries of forgery techniques, security techniques and so forth. This technology is deployed to create new passports that make forgery difficult through the employment of special dye, singular seals, data imprinting, identification of numbers repeated on each page by laser-print machines, machine-reading codes, digital imaging of passport holder, etc. On a global scale, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) has adopted the "online directory of competent national authorities" in order to help with the prosecution of traffickers. The online directory assists national authorities in accessing contact information for their fellow law enforcement officials in most countries around the world. This password protected online directory provides a means of communication and information sharing on the legal requirements for cooperation between countries (e.g., extradition of persons, transfer of sentenced persons). On a smaller scale, law enforcement agencies can use technology to obtain evidence against traffickers that will help in their prosecution. Law enforcement and anti-trafficking organizations often use mobile phones as a way of identifying, tracking, and prosecuting traffickers. Law enforcement agents have described mobile and smartphones as an "evidentiary gold mine" because they can contain critical information or data (e.g., corroborate relationships between traffickers and victims/survivors, provide geo-location or movement of victims/survivors) that can be used to prosecute traffickers.

As for traffickers who are less technologically-savvy, law enforcement may be able to obtain identifying and incriminating information from chat rooms, social media sites, and websites, especially if the traffickers are not familiar with how to cover their tracks online. Although increasingly aware, many law enforcement agencies at the local and national levels lack comprehensive technological training and basic technological resources. A concern is that developing countries will not be able to meet the costs of maintaining and supporting new technology strategies in order to prevent or minimize trafficking across borders and/or that local law enforcement will not receive appropriate training or the basic equipment needed to properly investigate and prosecute trafficking cases by using Technology to Raise Awareness, Share Information, and Elicit Change, the internet provides a global soapbox where individuals, communities, groups, and organizations can share information and raise awareness on human trafficking. Often these websites describe the issue, list services for survivors, and provide further resources. Due to the global scope of the internet, anyone with access can view these websites. Some examples of Canadian websites on human trafficking are: [www.endhumantrafficking.net](http://www.endhumantrafficking.net) (Ottawa Coalition to End Human Trafficking); [www.freethem.ca](http://www.freethem.ca) (FreeThem!); and [www.pact-ottawa.org](http://www.pact-ottawa.org) (PACT-Ottawa: Persons Against the Crime of Trafficking in Humans). Very often, anti-trafficking groups and organizations will use social media platforms (e.g., Facebook) to create online groups to share information and expand their reach. For example, 2PACT-Ottawa created a Facebook page that currently has 150 page 'likes'. In order to raise awareness and share information on human trafficking, one can also make recourse to blogging. A blog is a discussion or information website that typically displays posts or entries in a reverse chronological order. Any person can create a blog online for free. An example of a blog that discusses human trafficking is Hope for the Sold ([www.hopeforthesold.com](http://www.hopeforthesold.com)). Hope for the Sold is a blog created by a Canadian couple passionate about ending human trafficking. The blog shares information, resources, films and events on human trafficking in Canada and across the globe. The internet is also used to widely publicize and disseminate public education campaigns and online training initiatives on human trafficking. One well known global awareness and education campaign is Not For Sale ([www.notforsalecampaign.org](http://www.notforsalecampaign.org)). This campaign increases awareness and knowledge about human trafficking through a variety of materials available from their website including map which allows website visitors to document cases of known human trafficking around the world.

The British Columbia Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons and Public Safety Canada developed an online training course designed to help service providers identify, protect, and assist persons who may have been trafficked.

Human Trafficking: Canada is dubbed as Not Immune ([www.pssg.gov.bc.ca/octip/training.htm](http://www.pssg.gov.bc.ca/octip/training.htm)) contains four training modules: defining human trafficking; Canada's response to human trafficking; how to recognize a trafficked person; and how to help a trafficked person. Another very common form of social activism that is deployed is petitions. With the introduction of the internet, social activists can reach a broader group of people that share similar ideals and are willing to share their voice in order to encourage change. A popular social activist site is Change.org. With over 25 million users, this website provides a platform for people to get together behind a cause to demand accountability and inspire change. Many of the online petitions on Change.org relate to human trafficking and this ranks among the twelve "top causes" featured. Indeed, in 2010, Craigslist was compelled to shut down its "adult services" section and this was in response to pressures from several anti-trafficking organizations. A petition was also signed by more than 10,000 Change.org members. Social awareness and activism in preventing human trafficking is now starting to take place on mobile phones. For example, Prevent Human Trafficking ([www.preventhumantrafficking.org](http://www.preventhumantrafficking.org)) has created the Rapid Report & Response (R3) mobile system. If an individual suspects human trafficking is taking place, she/he can text a message that will be securely routed to the nearest first responder who will go to the site of the report and look for evidence of the incident. If the first responder confirms that the trafficking incident occurred, she/he will send a text that will create a red dot on a digital map and alert the nearest security enforcement agents. The agents will then attempt to intervene in the potential human trafficking case. The intervention will be digitally mapped by a blue dot. This map will appear on the Prevent Human Trafficking website which will allow people to track down human trafficking cases. If the enforcement agents are not successful in their attempt to intervene, they can text a message and the blue dot will be replaced with a black dot. However, if the enforcement agents are able to successfully resolve the incident, the black dot will be replaced with a green dot. The R3 will generate useful tracking data that will help NGOs and government agencies to intervene and prevent human trafficking more effectively.

The R3 mobile phone service is being tested in Thailand with the intention of expanding it to other countries in Southeast Asia, South Asia, India, and eventually to other parts of the world. Another example of a mobile phone service that raises awareness of human trafficking is Free2Work. Free2Work was developed by the Not For Sale Campaign ([www.free2work.org](http://www.free2work.org)). Free2Work is a mobile phone application that provides information on forced and child labour related to particular companies and brands. Specifically, Free2Work assesses companies on how labour trafficking relates to their supply chain practices in terms of company policies, traceability, transparency, monitoring and training, or worker rights. Free2Work allot each company a grade based on the found rating. The Free2Work app allowed consumers to search for the overall grading of specific companies and support those that had a zero tolerance for forced labour. Technology is constantly evolving and providing traffickers with new opportunities for exploitation. However, these same technologies used by traffickers can become a powerful tool to combat trafficking in persons, so long as its deployment takes into account the changing meanings of trafficking not only as an economic activity but also as a culture. In order to keep pace with the rapid evolution of these meanings, it is important for counter-trafficking responses to maintain constant vigilance and assert the use of technology in the strategy to prevent human trafficking. Equally important is the need to be cognizant of the potential benefits and unintended negative consequences to victims/survivors. It is with a view to confront these consequences that The Center on Communication Leadership and Policy developed five guiding principles for future technological interventions in trafficking in persons:

First, beneficiaries of any technological intervention must be victims and survivors of human trafficking. Second, successful accomplishment of anti-trafficking technologies requires cooperation among actors across government, nongovernmental, and private sectors, sharing information and communicating in a coordinated manner. Third, private-sector technology firms have to recognize that their services and networks were being exploited by traffickers and take steps to innovate and develop anti-trafficking initiatives through their technologies and policies. Fourth, continuous participation and investigations are necessary to ensure that tools were user-centric and refined over time to most effectively respond to shifts in technology and trafficking and; fifth, technological interventions ought to account for the range of human rights potentially impacted by the use of advanced technologies.

Africa is yet to take advantage of ICTs to fight crimes from migration such as trafficking, terrorism, gender inequality, hate speech and worker discrimination. In the area of narration of trafficking in migration, ICT tools such as CCTV technology, tracking technology, social media and mobile phones can be efficient when used jointly to fight this crime. These are now everyday technologies, which prioritize information in crime detection and communication which is accurate and easily available. ICTs have a huge role to play in promoting interactivity with organization fighting against trafficking. There is a need to set up an organization at continental level with branches in every African nation state. This structure would be charged with liaising with other professional structures working with at-risk or trafficked youth/adults such as ICT SOS, a Wichita-based organization which helps to track down human trafficking victims, to assist them to get a fresh start, to give them information and other resources and volunteers to work with trafficked youth, and provide education to keep other kids from falling prey to sex traffick. This organization can partner with the Wichita ICT SOS volunteers to connect with local agencies volunteering to fight sex trafficking. The police in London deploys ICTs to aid in monitoring road traffic, where officers can watch traffic images live and direct them on the ground to incidents by use of CCTV. The Metropolitan Police in London is one of the largest CCTV schemes. It monitors the M25 and all the routes in and out of London including the main roads in central London (Cheng *et al.*, 2013). Western Australia Police have reduced crime through the use of predictive analytics and GPS maps which show crime hotspots in the state. By using business intelligence (BI) it has been able to build up a picture of crimes committed over the past five years. The police have combined data from other government agencies to identify areas of social disadvantage. Bus routes and CCTV data have also been

overlaid on to the maps. The Police in Australia used data to assign patrols to hotspot areas in a bid to increase response times when a crime occurs. The police analyse social media using text mining. Crime analysts used to spend two hours every day looking at the previous day's reports. Today there's a code which skims all of the data from the previous night so it now takes 30 seconds. In addition, the Police now sends messages via Twitter or Facebook to people who have organized large parties telling them that the party is being monitored [www.cio.com.au/article-09 August, 2013].

As a result of this serious *impasse* of inter/national development, McGregor and Siegel (2013) advocates for tools such as data mining, mapping and advanced analytics that can be used to prevent the increasing prospects of trafficking, protection of victims, and prosecution of traffickers using data derived from social media. For example, one research study proposes the use of the Twitter Search Function. For a period of one week in June 2011, posts were collected that contained the word 'escort'. After filtering out noise (such as 'police escort', 'Ford escort'), a sample of 315 posts containing this term was found (Latonero *et al.*, 2012). With this data, the researchers performed several analytical techniques including the creation of 'word clouds'. Word clouds allow users to better visualize a corpus of text by giving great prominence to words that feature more frequently within the text. This can be used to identify common features of posts such as geographical areas which can be used to further refine the tools used to identify possible traffickers online. Another study reported in Latonero *et al.* (2012) looks at the potentials for online network analysis using a combination of human experts and computer-assisted technologies. For a period of three months, a computer-assisted programme mined data from the Los Angeles Backpage website, which is an online classified service. The programme collected 55,000 potential advertisements using term frequency analysis to filter articles with age/gender indicators, such as 'young' and 'girl'; indicators of nationalities and ethnicities; and transitory indicators such as 'visiting'. Experts could then input various permutations of these indicators in order to identify possible advertisements by human traffickers. A similar technique is used with TrafficBot to automatically police online classified advertisements with minimal human resource input (Wang and Biedermann, 2012). Despite these innovative approaches, Latonero *et al.* (2012) is concerned that social media is often neglected by law enforcers in favour of adult classified sites, which are more visible and accessible for investigation.

There is a lack of research focusing on the perspective of victims of trafficking, which is in part due to the gate-keeping role of NGOs working with the victims of trafficking, making it difficult for researchers to gain access to trafficking victims (Latonero *et al.*, 2012). There are anecdotal media stories, however, about the use of social media platforms to reunite victims of trafficking with their families. For example, a recent news article reported that a Chinese man who had been internally trafficked after being kidnapped as a child was reunited with his family 23 years after his abduction with the help of an online community explicitly started to help trafficked children identify their families and communities of origin. Through the online forum 'Baby Come Home', users share their memories about their childhoods and abduction experiences, which volunteers use to identify possible source communities and potential birth parents (Hooper, 2013). Elliott and McCartan (2013), have attempted to understand the use of technology to traffic by conducting in-depth interviews with professionals working with victims of trafficking in the UK. They find that technology can act as a form of additional control that allows the trafficker to better monitor their victims. While it may be assumed that access to technology would be restricted by traffickers to avoid victims seeking help, this highlights a complexity which is inherent to the human trafficking literature: notably the degree of agency that can be involved even when one is in an exploitative situation

A central database that has details of all citizens and has links to other databases such as the car registration database held at the Drivers Vehicle Licensing Agency and to another powerful computer running the Automated Fingerprint Identification system. This integrated system helps in tracking down and controlling crime. Jamaica is taking full advantage of the offering of Information Communication Technology (ICT) in combating crime across the island. A number of crime control and prevention initiatives have been implemented with the use of modern technology. Among these is the recent upgrading of the Jamaica Constabulary Force's (JCF) Automated Palm and Fingerprint Identification System (APFIS) at a cost of \$260 million. In addition, the Blackberry (smart phone) law enforcement database has been installed on some 550 handsets of traffic and operational personnel across the island and the smart phone application has been used to check the authenticity of drivers' licenses and motor vehicle documents. The analogue police radio system has been converted to a digital system with enhanced capabilities at a cost of \$240 million [Athaliah Reynolds B. 2013, Govt Making use of ICT in fighting crime, *Jamaica Information Service*,]. The Italian Government is also using a new Business and Location Intelligence system to fight crime. Aiming at enhancing the enforcement actions taken to combat crime in the entire Italian territory, the Department of Public Security of the Italian Ministry of the Interior adopted an advanced business intelligence system based on Oracle Business Intelligence to produce detailed analysis of criminal events evaluating all the aspects of each crime (victim, author, geography, time, type). The solution has been developed within the SIGR project (Integrated System for the Geo-referencing of Crimes) with the support of I consulting, Oracle's Platinum Partner, which has in-depth expertise in the field of Business and Location Intelligence. Today the new system allows the Department of Public Safety to be quickly updated on the progress of cases and the Italian situation related to crimes [Cinisello Balsamo (MI), www.oracle.com, Oracle Press Release: -November 6, 2012.]. In the U.S.A, more and more police departments are utilizing GPS technology as a part of their crime-prevention and crime-fighting strategies. With its ability to accurately locate individuals and vehicles, this technology is providing a range of new law enforcement solutions. GPS-based law enforcement technologies can be used in the following ways: emergence response, patrol management, individual and vehicle tracking and gunshot detection [www.navigation.com Fighting Crime with GPS Technology, 2012.]

African countries should install Closed circuit television (CCTV) cameras on public highways and in shopping malls and arcades. CCTV cameras can constantly monitor what people do. CCTV is also used by the police to

monitor road traffic. The police services in Africa adopt what their counterparts in developed countries use CCTV for, such as surveillance of target premises and locations where police have intelligence that crime is likely to occur. These types of CCTV operations are used to remotely monitor premises without having to have police officers engaged in long term operational surveillance. It can be used in emergence response, patrol management, individual and vehicle tracking and gunshot detection. Tracking Technology In the past, GPS devices were large, unwieldy and expensive. As a result, few law enforcement agencies have access to them. Today, GPS devices can be produced in small packages that can be easily concealed in a suspect's vehicle. Armed with these GPS devices, law enforcement agents can track suspects and use their locations as potential evidence. In addition, cell phones constantly communicate with cell towers, and detailed logs can reveal where particular individuals were located during particular periods of time. This information can be subpoenaed and used as evidence against alleged criminals. Thanks to this technology, more criminals are behind bars where they cannot commit further crimes in many developed countries (Drew 2013). The law enforcement agencies in Africa can use the social media. It is a great way to distribute information, and news of crime can quickly spread across these networks. By sharing a surveillance camera image on social media, law enforcement agents may be able to get tips as to the identity of the perpetrator. Social media can also be a great place to share tips for avoiding dangerous areas and tips for keeping safe against crime. Mobile Phones Modern systems can be accessed through smartphones and other mobile devices, which allows homeowners to get instant alerts about potential property crimes. Another advantage of modern systems is that they can automatically alert law enforcement agents. Because of this, homeowners may not need to call the cops after a robbery has transpired; police officers may be able to respond while the crime is in progress

ICTs have proven to be critical to public awareness campaigns including the DNA Foundation's "Real Men Don't Buy Girls" campaign, which has helped educate the public on child slavery via social media platforms such as Facebook and Twitter. In fact, organizations are increasingly cognizant of ICT's as an effective tool for expanding public understanding of human trafficking. Shared Hope International's YouTube channel, the Coalition to Abolish Slavery & Trafficking's webinars, and this very blog are but a few examples of such recognition. Smartphone applications like the International Justice Mission's IJM Mobile also signify the emergence of ICT's as a useful anti-trafficking tool. Through IJM Mobile's "Make Some Noise" feature, users can easily help raise public awareness and galvanize support for anti-trafficking policies by posting the latest trafficking-related news in their social networks. Technological innovation in the anti-trafficking field is further exemplified by Survivors Connect, a California-based organization dedicated to leveraging ICT's against human trafficking. Like IJM, Survivors Connect employs mobile technology with its SMS: Freedom helpline service, through which users can reduce their risk of victimization by connecting to professionals and resources (e.g. information about trafficking scams, safe migration, child protection, and emergency support) via text messaging. Beyond mobile technology, Survivors Connect offers a range of data mapping programs, notably Freedom Datamap, which crowd sources information about where anti-trafficking organizations work and provide services globally. Freedom Datamap enables professionals, lawyers, service providers, government agencies, and international organizations to share critical trafficking information in a single space. Users submit their information through various media (e.g. email, Twitter, web reports), which is then aggregated into direct reports and plotted on an interactive map. With this program, users can easily access and share data, thereby empowering them to enhance collaboration efforts, learn best practices, and identify gaps in knowledge.

## 5. Conclusion

In conclusion, this paper has discussed the issue of migration and trafficking as a metanarrative that can lead to self-development of society and communities if digital technology is deployed critically to combat the trafficking problem. Whether it is about raising awareness of the issue through Facebook or sharing the latest research through a webinar, anti-trafficking work has great potential to improve as technology continues to advance. For many, this could mean a life free from the violence, exploitation, and abuse endured under the conditions of modern-day slavery. Using creative works and films and exploiting insights from a critical discourse paradigm, this chapter has also argued that to develop an ICT model for fighting trafficking in the contexts of migration and development, one has to depart from the economic base of trafficking to ideological questions of risk, liberalism, managerial effort, concepts of tracking not only as crime but also as work, empowerment, adventure, culture, patriarchy, and globalization. Trafficking is not only an economic issue; it is also a bigger question of evolution of civilization. An effective ICT model must engage seriously with the bigger picture of the knowledge economy. The ICT model must emphasize education and not merely repression. The pedagogical function of this model should incorporate more about education of the world and this should even include education that targets traffickers themselves. Former traffickers can then join the bandwagon to education other present and prospective ones so that we can rid the globalizing world of this ill.

## References

- Baker, C. N. (2013). Moving beyond "slaves, sinners, and saviors": An intersectional feminist analysis of us sex-trafficking discourses, law and policy. *The Journal of Feminist Scholarship*, 4(Spring): 1-23.
- Breuil, B. C. O., Siegel, D., Van Reenen, P., Beijer, A. and Roos, L. (2011). Human trafficking revisited: Legal, enforcement and ethnographic narratives on sex trafficking to western Europe. *Trends in Organized Crime*, 14(1): 30-46.
- Castles, S. (2013). The forces driving global migration. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 34(2): 122-40.

- Cheng, J., Deng, Y., Meng, H. and Wang, Z., 2013. "A facial expression based continuous emotional state monitoring system with GPU acceleration." In *In 2013 10th IEEE International Conference And Workshops on Automatic Face and Gesture Recognition (FG)*. pp. 1-6.
- Diome, F. (2003). *Le ventre de l'Atlantique*. Anne Carrière: Paris.
- Elliott, J. and McCartan, K. (2013). The reality of trafficked people's access to technology. *The Journal of Criminal Law*, 77(3): 255-73.
- Elster, J. (1978). Exploring exploitation. *Journal of Peace Research*, 15(1): 3-17.
- Fatal Promises (2009). Directed by katharina rohrer documentary 1h 30m. By neil genzlinger. Available: [http://www.fatalpromises.com/Fatal\\_Promises/Home.html](http://www.fatalpromises.com/Fatal_Promises/Home.html)
- Ford, M., Lyons, L. and van Schendel, W. (2012). *Labour migration and human trafficking: An introduction*. In *labour migration and human trafficking in southeast asia*. Routledge. 17-38.
- Gilroy, P. (2002). *Route work: The black atlantic and the politics of exile*. In *the postcolonial question*. Routledge. 27-39.
- Held, D. (1980). *Introduction to critical theory: Horkheimer to habermas*. 261 vols.: University of California Press: California.
- Hooper, C. A. (2013). *Mothers surviving child sexual abuse*. Routledge: London.
- Jeffreys, S. (1999). Globalizing sexual exploitation: Sex tourism and the traffic in women. *Leisure Studies*, 18(3): 179-96.
- Kaiwa, E., 2017. "Sustainable tourism in asia—current situation, trends, and existing practices." In *Sustainable Asia: Supporting the transition to sustainable consumption and production in Asian developing countries*. pp. 359-89.
- Kempadoo, K., 2005. "From moral panic to global justice: Changing perspectives on trafficking." In *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*. pp. 3-24.
- Kondracki, L., Weisz, R., Strathairn, D., Kaas, N. L., Anissimova, A., Condurache, R. and Bellucci, M. (2011). *The whistleblower*. Impuls Home Entertainment.
- Latonero, M., Wex, B. and Dank, M. (2015). *Technology and labor trafficking in a network society: General overview, emerging innovations, and philippines case study*. Emerging Innovations, and Philippines Case Study.
- Latonero, M., Musto, J., Boyd, Z., Boyle, E., Bissel, A., Gibson, K. and Kim, J. (2012). *The rise of mobile and the diffusion of technology-facilitated trafficking*. University of Southern California, Center on Communication Leadership and Policy: Los Angeles, CA. 43.
- Macey, J. R., Miller, G. P. and Carnell, R. S. (2001). *Banking law and regulation*. Aspen Publishers.
- Marx, K. (1867/1976). *Capital: A critique of political economy*. Penguin: London.
- McGregor, E. and Siegel, M. (2013). *Social media and migration research*. United Nations University-Maastricht Economic and Social Research Institute on Innovation and Technology (MERIT).
- Medovarski, A. (2013). *Currency and cultural consumption: Lawrence hill's the book of Negroes*. Studies in Canadian Literature/Études en littérature canadienne. 38.
- Mignolo, W. D. (2007). Delinking: The rhetoric of modernity, the logic of coloniality and the grammar of de-coloniality. *Cultural Studies*, 21(2-3): 449-514.
- Ngwa, W. and Ngwa, L. (2006). *From dust to snow: Bush-faller*. Lulu. com.
- Noh, S., Kim, A. H. and Noh, M. S. (2012). *Korean immigrants in Canada: perspectives on migration, integration, and the family*. University of Toronto Press: Toronto.
- Pajnik, M. (2010). Media framing of trafficking. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 12(1): 45-64.
- Roemer, J. E. (1986). *Exploitation and labour theory of value*. Economic and Political Weekly. 138-40.
- Rosenblum, M. R. and Ball, I. (2016). *Trends in unaccompanied child and family migration from Central America*. Migration Policy Institute: Washington, DC.
- Schumpeter, J. A. (1949). Science and ideology. *The American Economic Review*, 39(2): 346-59.
- Skrobanek, S., Boonpakdee, N. and C., J. (1997). The traffic in women: human realities 0/the international sex trade. Available: <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/journal-of-southeast-asian-studies/article/traffic-in-women-human-realities-of-the-international-sex-trade-by-siriporn-skrobanek-nattaya-boonpakdi-and-chutima-janthakeero-london-zed-books-1997-ppviii-124-bibliography-index/EE57012C49B997A98AF9719B7FD1DDEB>
- Steiner, H. (1984). A liberal theory of exploitation. *Ethics*, 94(2): 225-41.
- Usman, U. M. (2014). Trafficking in women and children as vulnerable groups: Talking through theories of international relations. *European Scientific Journal*, 10(17): 282–92.
- Wallace, B. and Zamora, J. H. (2004). *Sex trafficking ruthless, lucrative/Brothels proliferate despite crackdowns*. San Francisco Chronicle.
- Wang, T. and Biedermann, S., 2012. "Adoption and utilization of electronic health record systems by long-term care facilities in Texas." In *Perspectives in Health Information Management/AHIMA, American Health Information Management Association*.
- Wiggershaus, R. (1994). *The Frankfurt School: Its history, theories, and political significance*. MIT Press: Cambridge.
- Yazgan, P., Utku, D. E. and Sirkeci, I. (2015). Syrian crisis and migration. *Migration Letters*, 12(3): 181-92.
- Zafirovski, M. (2003). The question of mathematical social theory revisited: Some methodological considerations. *The American Sociologist*, 34(4): 59-80.

Zagheni, E., Garimella, V. R. K. and Weber, I., 2014. "Inferring international and internal migration patterns from twitter data." In *Proceedings of the 23rd International Conference on World Wide Web. ACM*. pp. 439-44.